



國立中山大學公共事務管理研究所

碩士論文

我國女性政務官參政因素分析

**Determinants of Political Participation of Female Appointees  
in Taiwan**

研究生：簡美娟 撰

指導教授：朱斌好 博士

中華民國 九十四 年 六 月



國立中山大學公共事務管理研究所

碩士論文

我國女性政務官參政因素分析

**Determinants of Political Participation of Female Appointees**

**in Taiwan**



研究生：簡美娟 撰

指導教授：朱斌好 博士

中華民國 九十四 年 六 月

國立中山大學研究生學位論文審定書

本校公共事務管理研究所碩士班

研究生簡美娟(學號：M9144622) 所提論文

**Determinants of Political Participation of Female Appointees in  
Taiwan**

經本委員會審查並舉行口試，符合碩士學位論文標準。

學位考試委員簽章：

召集人 黃競涓博士

黃競涓

委員 朱斌好博士

朱斌好

委員 蔣麗君博士

蔣麗君

指導教授(可免)

朱斌好

系主任/所長(可免)

## **Acknowledgements**

It's a great thing to graduate from graduate school. First, I would like to thank Prof. Chu Ping-Yu for her hardship to instruct me for these three years. She is a great and intelligent teacher that I admire a lot. Without her, I couldn't fulfill this thesis. I also want to express my gratitude to Prof. Hwang and Prof. Chiang to provide me valuable advices in my oral exam.

Second, I would like to thank my parents and John for their financial and emotional support during my student life. They often encouraged me when I felt frustrated and discouraged.

I was helped by many female appointees and their secretaries. Thank them for sharing their life stories and political experiences with me and with the readers of this thesis.

I would also want to express my gratitude to my dear friends and teachers in these three years. With your companion, my life filled with joy and happiness.

Finally, I want to send my best wishes to my dear teachers, dear friends, and people around the world. Wish all of us could work together for a friendly, joyful, and beautiful world!

With love,

Mei-chuan

The summer of 2005

## 摘要

女性在多數的政府部門仍處於邊緣化位置，尤其是在政治任命的職位上。本研究訪問十六位女性政務官，研究發現她們個個是菁英，出身自立委、教授、教師或記者等。多數女性政務官經由對政治與社會運動的主動參與，展露出對政治濃厚的興趣。這些經歷讓她們從運動邁入政府部門。本研究的受訪者表示總統或縣市長們肯定她們過去的工作經驗與行政經歷，因而邀請她們入閣。

我們發現有些受訪者的母親反對女兒踏入政治。再者，公/私與男/女的分野產生對男、女政務官在家務照養上，甚或他/她們從政能力上等，不同的期待標準。

性別大不同。女性政務官傾向於拔擢其部門的優秀女性並改善過去看似性別中立的政策來幫助女性取得較佳的生活。一些女性政務官也表達出身為女性在決策過程中的性別敏銳度。

為了提升女性參與政治，本研究建議提高國家政策的性別敏感度，並著重強調學校教育與大眾教育來讓年輕一代參與政治。此外，性別比例制度亦能提高女性參與政治的機會。

**關鍵字：**女性政務官、女人、政治、性別比率

## **Abstract**

Women continue to be marginalized at most levels of government, especially in political appointment positions. This research interviewed sixteen female political appointees. We found they were drawn from elites, such as legislators, professors, teachers, lawyers and journalists. Most female appointees showed profound political interests through active participation in political activities and social movements, which allows them from movement to government. Interviewees in this research expressed that the president or their mayor invited them to serve as such posts because of appreciation of their past working experiences and administrative experiences.

We found some mothers opposed their daughters to step into politics. Furthermore, the very division between public/private and man/woman composes the different expectations on male and female political appointees, such as domestic chores, caring and even their abilities in dealing with politics.

Gender makes a difference. Female interviewees tended to promote capable female in their divisions and redressed the past “gender-neutral” policy to help women have a better life. Some female political appointees also expressed their unique sensitivity as women in decision-making process.

In order to increase women to participate in politics, this research suggests raising gender awareness in policies and stress on school education and public education for engaging younger generations. Further, gender quota can increase women’s opportunity to serve as political appointees.

**Keyword: female appointee, women, politics, gender quota**

## Contents

Chapter 1	Introduction.....	1
1.1	Background.....	1
1.2	Research Purpose.....	4
Chapter 2	Literature Review.....	6
2.1	Definition of Political Appointees.....	6
2.2	Feminism and Politics.....	8
2.3	Factors Influencing Women to Participate in Politics.....	10
2.4	Personal Motive and Other Personal Factors.....	14
2.5	Influence of Political Systems.....	18
2.6	Other Factors.....	21
Chapter 3	Research Design.....	27
3.1	Sampling.....	27
3.2	Interview Questions.....	29
3.3	Interview Process.....	30
Chapter 4	Female Appointees in Taiwan.....	32
4.1	Personal Motive and Other Personal Factors.....	32
4.2	Influence of Political Systems.....	49
4.3	Other Factors.....	54
4.4	Female Political Research Results Comparison.....	64
Chapter 5	Women in Politics.....	68
5.1	Women Make a Difference.....	68
5.2	Appointive Factors.....	69
5.3	Interactions with Parliaments and Other Departments.....	71
5.4	Characteristics of Female Appointees.....	78
5.5	Policy Suggestions from Our Interviewees.....	79
Chapter 6	Policy Suggestions and Conclusions.....	88
6.1	Research Findings.....	88
6.2	Policy Suggestions.....	90
6.3	Suggestions for Follow-up Study.....	91
Appendix I	Political Appointment Positions.....	92
Appendix II	Female Political Appointees Profile.....	99
Reference	.....	103

## Tables

Table 1.1.	Female Leaders in the World.....	2
Table 1.2.	Gender Ratio of Population and Political Appointment.....	2
Table 1.3.	The Figure and Ratio of Female Representatives.....	3
Table 2.1.	Factors Influencing Female Political Participation.....	12
Table 4.1.	Grass-root Activities of Interviewees.....	34
Table 4.2.	Gender Ratio of College Students in Taiwan, 1966-2001.....	58
Table 4.3.	Major Employment Pattern of Female Political Appointees.....	61
Table 4.4.	Research Results Comparison between Our Research and Hsu' .....	64



# Chapter 1 Introduction

## 1.1 Background

Co-governance by men and women is a main issue for a healthy society. It is not until gender parity is reached on governance, women cannot reach full equality with men in any sphere (United Nations Development Programme, 2000). The way of the allocation of power and national resource is an indicator of equality. To influence the allocation of power and resource, people have to participate in politics. As women become leaders in positions of power, sexist attitudes and stereotypes where men were defined as the “head” of their families, politics and almost any other position of leadership and authority could be changed. Substantively, women’s representatives in a patriarchal politics arena are expected to engage on women’s and other minority groups’ concerns (Peng, 2000).

There is various access of formal political participation. The spectrum of formal political participation includes the rights to vote, to take public examinations and hold public offices, to run elections and to serve as political appointees. Even though women represent 52% of the world’s population, the average proportion of women parliamentarians worldwide is just 14.2% by 2002 (Muñoz, 2002). In terms of women’s political appointment positions, 5.4 % of cabinet ministers were women in 1994 (Corner, 1997) and 12% of ministers and deputy ministers in 1999 (IPU 1999). Although in the year 2000, the average percentage of European women in ministerial positions increased to 27.7% from 7.3% in 1987 (Muñoz, 2002), the levels of European women’s political representation in appointment positions is still far less than men.

Moreover, out of over 180 countries, only twelve were currently governed by women as shown in Table 1.1. In other words, this world is still mainly ruled by men. Even for other leadership positions in government, women compose only five Vice Presidents, four Governor-Generals and four Major Opposition Leaders, including Annette Lu, Vice President of Taiwan, who triggered the first wave of Taiwan women’s movement in the early 70’s “New Feminism”.

Table 1.1. Female Leaders in the World

Name	Position
Nino Burzhanadze	Acting President of Georgia
Helen Clark	Prime Minister of New Zealand
Tarja Halonen	President of Finland
Chandrika Kumaratunga	President of Sri Lanka
Gloria Macapagal-Arroyo	President of the Philippines
Mary McAleese	President of Ireland
Mireya Moscoso	President of Panama
Jennifer Smith	Premier of Bermuda
Maria das Neves Ceita Baptisa de Sousa	Prime Minister of the Democratic Republic of São Tomé and Príncipe
Megawati Sukarnoputri	President of Indonesia
Vaira Vike-Freiberga	President of Latvia
Khaleda Zia	Prime Minister of Bangladesh

Note. Women's Learning Partnership. (2004). Retrieved July 6, 2004, from <http://learningpartnership.org/facts/leadership.phtml>

The gender statistics for population in Taiwan for 1996 to 2002 (Bureau of Statistics, 2003) suggest that the population of women is more than men. Table 1.2. shows 51 percent of the population were women in 2002. However, women only composed around 10 percent in appointment compared with 90 percent men.

Table 1.2. Gender Ratios of Population and Political Appointment

Year	Population Ratio		Political Appointment Ratio	
	Women	Men	Women	Men
1996	58.2	41.8	7	93
1997	58.8	41.2	7.2	92.8
1998	59.6	40.4	7.5	92.5
1999	60.4	39.6	8.4	91.6
2000	60.7	39.3	10.5	89.5
2001	51.1	48.9	9.4	90.6
2002	51	49	10.7	89.3

Note. Bureau of Statistics. (2003). Retrieved November 28, 2003, from [http://www.dgbas.gov.tw/dgbas03/div2all.htm\(2003/11/28\)](http://www.dgbas.gov.tw/dgbas03/div2all.htm(2003/11/28)).

The statistics of elections (Central Election Commission, 2005) suggest that women are considerably underrepresented than men. Table 1.3. shows that women in Taiwan are chronically underrepresented in various elections. In the categories of President, Mayor of Taipei and Kaohsiung, Chief Executive of Township less than 10 percent were women, and more than 90 percent men. In terms of legislative members, the ratio of elected women decreased from 22.22 percent in 2001 to 20.89 in 2005.

Table 1.3. The Figure and Ratio of Female Representatives

Year	Election	Candidates		Total Elected	Elected female	Ratio of elected female (%)
		Male	Female			
1995	Members of The Third Legislative Yuan	347	50	164	23	14.02
1996	The Ninth President	4	0	1	0	0
	Members of The Third National Assembly	488	103	334	61	18.26
1997	Magistrate	75	5	23	3	13.04
1998	Member of County Council	1636	316	890	151	16.97
	Chief Executive, Township Government	760	67	319	18	5.64
1998	Mayor of Taipei and Kaohsiung	7	0	2	0	0
	Member of Taipei City Council	81	27	52	17	32.69
	Member of Kaohsiung City Council	83	14	43	5	11.63
	Member of The Fourth Legislative Yuan	412	86	225	43	19.11
2000	The Tenth President	5	0	1	0	0
2001	Magistrate	78	10	23	2	8.7

(table continues)

Table 1.3. (continued)

Year	Election	Candidates		Total Elected	Elected female	Ratio of elected female (%)
		Male	Female			
2001	Member of The Fifth Legislative Yuan	474	110	225	50	22.22
2002	Member of County Council	1603	456	896	196	21.88
	Chief Executive, Township Government	815	66	319	20	6.27
2002	Mayor of Taipei and Kaohsiung	6	1	2	0	0
	Member of Taipei City Council	82	28	51	17	33.33
	Member of Kaohsiung City Council	95	19	44	9	20.45
2004	The Eleventh President	2	0	1	0	0
2004	Member of The Sixth Legislative Yuan	396	96	225	47	20.89
2005	Member of National Assembly	507	179	330	90	27.27

Note. Central Election Commission. (2005). Retrieved June 15, 2005, from <http://210.69.23.140/cec/cechead.asp>

Those figures reveal that women are marginalized in various political participations. The under-representation of women in political participation could enhance gender disparity. This is also practical problem faced by anyone involved in trying to create and maintain gender equality in our social institutions today (Sapiro, 2003).

## 1.2 Research Purpose

Women and men should have the equal opportunities, rights and responsibilities in all areas of life. Women need to gain entry to the decision-making process that will safeguard their interests themselves rather

than be content to rely on men to make decisions for them. However, despite the widespread democratization movement in the world, women continue to be marginalized at most levels of government, especially in political appointment positions. Female political appointees can influence our nation and our people profoundly through the policies they make and advocate. Until today, very little research has systematically explored the careers, policy contributions, or perspectives of these high-ranking executive women (Dolan, 2001). Thus, this research aims to:

- (1) Understand factors that influence female political participation, particularly the political participation of female political appointees;
- (2) Discover the deterrents of occupational obstacles for female political appointees with research of female legislators;
- (3) Provide meaningful suggestions to realize “Co-governance by men and women” in Taiwan.

To achieve our research purpose, this thesis first discusses the definition of political appointees in Taiwan with a parallel research on the important factors of female political participation. We introduce the appointment rules governing political appointees and analyze how those factors are related to political appointment of women.

In this research, we interview sixteen current female political appointees. Furthermore, this study probes research in women’s study to understand the forces that might affect their political participation, their experiences in reaching the high-ranking administrative position in Taiwan’s patriarchy political arena as well as the impact they have upon arrival. We also use second-hand data analysis to make our research more objective and abundant.

## **Chapter 2 Literature Review**

In this chapter, we review normative theories and empirical studies and discuss factors that female appointees participate in politics. We discuss the definition of the position of political appointees in the first section. After confirming the research arena and operational definition, the second section covers feminist theories to have a more profound understanding of women in politics. The third section focuses on empirical studies that women participate in politics and has a thorough discussion from participation motive, political socialization, participation opportunity and environmental factors in the fourth, the fifth, and the sixth section subsequently.

There are various ways of conventional political participation, such as the rights to vote, to take public examinations and hold public offices, to stand for elections and to serve as political appointees, and unconventional forms of political participation, such as boycotts and demonstrations, which may sometimes be illegal.

Randall (1987) studied women's underrepresentation by different institutional arenas of political participation: (1) parties and representative legislatures that form a channel of 'numerical representation'- that is, representation on the basis of 'one person, one vote'; (2) the agencies of interest representation; (3) the institutions of political administration; (4) the judiciary; (5) the communications media that is less formally integrated into the political system. According, female appointees who participate in politics belong to the third category, i.e., the institutions of political administration. In this category, Randall provided many cases of female cabinet ministers around the world, such as the cabinet of Mrs. Thatcher, the cabinet of Carter in the U.S. and other Western democracies and even the third world governments.

### **2.1 Definition of Political Appointees**

In modern democratic society, its power comes from the contentment of the ruled. As a result, the essence of democratic politics is politics of people's voices. Although the collection and expression of people's voices have various channels and methods, political positions are with the most functions and they are the proxy of political systems in modern democratic government.

Political appointees form an important part of most government structures. Although the vast majority of posts are filled by career civil servants from within the bureaucracy, a few of the key positions in each department may be filled from without. They are appointed outside of the merit-based bureaucratic structure, normally by the executive, and fulfill a variety of functions (Chanda, 2001).

Political appointees and career civil servants compose a dual system with the political appointees responsible for the policy and career civil servant responsible for the administration of the respective departments. Political appointees are responsible for the policy direction. They are answerable to Parliament and are responsible for a particular Ministry, and are expected to resign should there be serious problems within their Ministry (Chanda, 2001). Political appointees represent the ruling party and career civil servant remains apolitical. In party politics, the purpose of political appointment positions is to use political resources to influence political decision-makings in people's daily life and to shoulder the responsibilities and results of those political decision-makings; while career civil servants' indifference to political life ensures that it will be readily willing to serve any government, regardless of its political complexion and, as such, the government of the day is expected to work with senior civil servants left behind by previous administration. This dual system can ensure continuity in the civil service regardless of the results of elections.

Western countries, such as the United Kingdom, United States, and Germany, have their own respective long traditions of political appointment systems (Ciou & Jhang, 2002). With the young democratization of Taiwan, Taiwan does not have a unified law to regulate the political appointment system. Therefore, the regulations are shown in different acts. Political appointed positions within departments of the Taiwan Government are listed in Article II of Political Appointee Pension Act:

- I. Personnel appointed by the president and personnel by special appointment under R.O.C. Constitution
- II. Personnel nominated by the President and approved by the National Assembly or the Legislative Yuan under R.O.C. Constitution
- III. Personnel nominated by Premier and appointed by the President under R.O.C. Constitution
- IV. Personnel with positions of and above level twelve under other central acts

or local government acts.

This thesis applies the above definition of political appointee to conduct survey on the top-level positions that are politically appointed. Ministers, Directors of Bureau, and Secretary-General that are political appointed are on the list of this research's subject.

## **2.2 Feminism and Politics**

Suffrage, the right to vote, is the most basic form of democratic participation. However, women were excluded by the control and domination by men in the eighteenth-century revolutions. American revolutionaries drafted the Declaration of Independence (1776), and French revolutionaries drafted the Declaration of the Rights of Man and of the Citizens (1789). In these documents, only white men enjoy citizenship. Men represented their families in public sphere. They maintained financial security by going to work and protected their families' interests in relation to the state by participating in politics. Women maintained the private sphere. They didn't have the same rights to vote, nor did they have rights to education, to have property, etc, as middle-class men. Without such basic rights, women had but to depend on men (Fox-Genovese & Horstmann, 1995).

Under such background, the first wave of feminism (liberal feminism) began with a claim of 'adequate similarity', that is, of no differences that could justify discrimination on the grounds of sex. Where differences other than the biological at their most basic are said to occur, this school sets out to disprove the differences between genders, or to show that gender differences are the products of socialization by families or schools, or by, for example, medical experts, or the mass media, in later life (Evans, 1995). First wave feminism demanded women's suffrage and legal equality for both sexes in public sphere. They claimed women have the same potential and the same capabilities as men thus women deserve equal treatment.

New Zealand was the first country to give women the right to vote in 1893; and Finland was the first country to grant women the right to vote and the right to stand for elections in 1906. After World War I, the United States, England, and Germany enfranchised women for women's patriotism. However, there are



still few countries that deny women both the right to vote and the right to stand for elections (Shvedova, 1998).

Ku (2003) pointed out that Taiwan's women movement in 1980s and 1990s has profound influence from liberal feminism, such as petition for modification of sexual discriminations in laws, the slogan "Being a human being first, and then being a man or a woman" and anti-quota, which demonstrated the spirit of ignoring the difference and pursue for gender equality.

However, women remained extremely rare in the most lucrative occupations and the higher levels of political leadership. The provision of formally equal rights was insufficient; while women were subordinated by men, while they remained dominated by the masculine ethic and the public/private split, they cannot be equal. (Abbott & Wallace, 1990).

Second-wave feminism, in different ways, connected the continued gaps in the rights and opportunities women suffered in the public realm to the roles they played in the private sphere. The insistence that 'the personal is political' involved a major challenge to the assumptions of political theory and the focus on the private sphere brought a new range of issues into activism. The new areas included sexuality, reproduction, domestic labor and domestic violence (MaLaughlin, 2003).

Since 1987, in which martial law was lifted, Taiwan women's organizations started to use radical reforms to require equal working rights of men and women, to promote gender education, to reform politics, and to establish equal status in family for men and women. Feminists in Taiwan successfully put the agenda of anti-harassment from the previous private sphere into public political discussion. Meanwhile, women's organizations in Taiwan invited politicians and legislative candidates to make commitment to women's policies. Influenced by the actions of women's organizations, Taiwan government and political parties were urged to integrate ideas on equality between the sexes into the government agents, notably in the amendment or enactment of quota systems/proportional representation systems inside parties' regulations or laws.

However, the “under-representation” of women in political appointment is still a serious problem. It was not until 1988 that Taiwan has the first female minister of Finance, Shirley Kuo Wang-jung. Since the late 1980s, Taiwan presidents appointed more women into their cabinets. In 1990, Chang Po-Ya was appointed as the first female director general of Health. In 1993, Prof. Shen Hsueh-Young was appointed as chairperson of the Council of Cultural Planning and Development. In 1996, Lin Cheng-chih was appointed as chairperson of the Council of Cultural Planning and Development. In 1997, Yeh Chin-feng was appointed as the first female minister of the Interior, and later in 1999, the first female minister of Justice (World Guide to women in Leadership, 2004). In 2000, women composed 1/4 cabinet members. The ratio ranked the highest in all Asia countries; however, comparison with Scandinavian countries, there remains substantial room for continued improvement.

### **2.3 Factors Influencing Women to Participate in Politics**

In a liberal culture that values freedom, equality, and democracy, citizens are expected to engage in political activities, at least to the extent of voting in elections; citizens have options to participate even further, such as being active in a political party organization or running for public office or appointed in governmental posts.

Various researchers have identified factors that affect women’s decision to participate in politics. For example,

Shvedova (1998) using empirical data, information from a workshop<sup>1</sup>, and a meeting of women’s organizations and individual women activists, categorized the obstacles that women face in politics of parliament into three areas: socio-economic, political, and ideological and psychological (or socio-cultural). Socio-economic obstacles include the feminization of poverty and

---

<sup>1</sup>This workshop was on “Women in Parliament: Beyond Numbers” on 21-22 August 1997. It brought together female parliamentarians from around the world, international scholars, and observers from inter-governmental organizations to share experiences and discuss the obstacles women face in politics.

unemployment and the dual burden; political obstacles include masculine model of politics, lack of party support, cooperation with women's organizations, education and training, and electoral systems; and ideological and psychological hindrances include traditional roles, lack of confidence, the perception of politics as "dirty" and the role of mass media.

Park (1999) examines the case of women's political representation in South Korea. Her research explicates studies on women and political participation in the West by three dimensions: attitudinal, situational, and structural factors. (1) Attitudinal factors include the attitudes of voters, party elites, and women. (2) Situational factors include gender role constraints and the female eligible pool in politics. (3) Structural factors are related to the structure of political opportunity and the electoral systems.

Hsu (2002) interviews twenty one members of the Forth Legislative Yuan in Taiwan. She analyses political participation factors into three dimensions: first is the socialization process, which requires the personal motive; the second is the political systems and environment which each individual is situated; last is other social and economic factors.

Escobar-Lemmon and Taylor-Robinson (2004) examine political and socioeconomic factors that affect the supply and demand for female cabinet ministers in Latin America. They find that presidents from parties of the left appoint more women, partisan competition advantage women, increases in the percentage of women in the legislature correlate with more women in the cabinet, the number of women in the previous cabinet increases the appointment of women to top cabinet posts, and gender quotas for the legislature correlate with fewer women in the cabinet.

This research revised Hsu (2002)'s category of factors influencing women to participate in politics in Table 2.1. Hsu (2002) categorized factors affecting female political participation into fourteen categories: (1) personal motive; (2) political socialization process; (3) marriage; (4) Responsibilities of housework and child-caring; (5) Party politics; (6) Electoral system; (7) Political paradigm shift; (8) The attitudes of politicians; (9) Social-cultural factors; (10) Socioeconomic factors; (12) Social issues; (13) Movements; (14) Religions.

Table 2.1. Factors Influencing Female Political Participation

Author	Time	Summary	Influencing factors
Norris	1985	A cross-national study of 24 countries with a multiple regression analysis	1. Electoral system 2. Socio-economic status 3. Cultural factors
Medoff	1986	A regression analysis of determinants of the political participation of women	1. Marriage 2. The age of child 3. Religion 4. Founding capacity 5. Number of parliament seats
Oakes & Almquist	1993	A cross-national test of gender theories of women in 73 national legislatures	1. Women's labor force 2. Number of parliament seats
Arora & Prabhakar	1997	A study of socioeconomic background of women candidates in India	1. Family support 2. Education level
Paxton	1997	A cross-national study for two cross-sectional time periods-1975 and 1988	1. Party's nomination system 2. Consciousness of gender equality 3. Religion
Shvedova	1998	A study of the obstacles that women face in politics of parliament by empirical data	1. Socio-economic factors 2. Political factors 3. Ideological and psychological factors
Park	1999	A case study of women's political representation in South Korea	1. Attitudinal factors 2. Situational factors 3. Structural factors
Iwamoto	2000	A study of the Madonna boom that analyzed the progress of Japanese women in politics in the 1980s	1. Influential female leader 2. Party support 3. Social issues 4. Gender consciousness

(table continues)

Table 2.1. (continued)

Author	Time	Summary	Influencing factors
Escobar-Lemmon and Taylor-Robinson	2004	A study of female cabinet ministers in Latin America	1. Political factors 2. Socioeconomic factors
Paxton and Kunovich	2003	A cross-national study on women in national legislatures	1. Social structural factors 2. Political factors 3. Ideology
Fan	1981	A qualitative research of determinants of female political participation in Taiwan by in-depth interview	1. Family background 2. Political party enlistment 3. Housework and child-caring 4. Cultural factors
Liang	1993	A study of Taiwan female provincial councilors by statistical data	1. Political paradigm changes 2. Reserved-seats system 3. Party enlistment
Chiang	1996	A study of DPP female elites by in-depth interview	1. Family background 2. Profession 3. Political socialization
Peng	1998	A study of Taipei female village directors by in-depth interview	1. Patriarchy 2. Motherhood 3. Election culture
Hsu	2002	A study of 21 members of the 4th Legislative Yuan in Taiwan	1. Socialization process 2. Political systems and environment 3. Other social and economic factors

Note. *Critical influencing factors in women's political participation in Taiwan: a study on the 4<sup>th</sup> female legislators* (pp. 15-16), by Hsu, T. K. (2002). Unpublished master thesis, Institute of Public Affairs Management, National Sun Yat-sen University.

We adopt Hsu (2002)'s structure to discuss the factors of political participation of female appointees in Taiwan as personal motive and other personal factors in the fourth section, political factors in participation opportunity in the fifth section, and other factors in the sixth section.

## **2.4 Personal Motive and Other Personal Factors**

### **2.4.1 Personal Motive**

Different from craving for political power in male legislators, the motive of female legislators in Taiwan was much more passive. Most of them were summoned by political parties or encouraged by groups or families. Having profound political interests and actively participate in legislator's election was a rarity (Fan, 1981). Besides, during personal growing process, the concept of "Man and women are different" led women less evolved in political socialization. This reflected that the political participation motive of female influenced by social ideology was weaker than male's. However, in 1980's, in order to fulfill their dream of democracy, women in Taiwan assisted communities holding activities and actively participate in political activities. After liberalization in 1990's, the multiple backgrounds of female village directors in Taipei also reflected the adjustment and transformation of female political participation factors (Peng, 1998).

Political paradigm shift and the increase of women's self-consciousness influenced female's political participation in Taiwan. Chiang (1996) interviewed fifteen Democratic Progressive Party (DPP) female political elites. Ten out of fifteen interviewees belonged to independent political participators; most interviewees had participated in non-partisan movement when they were students. Some of them were deeply influenced by and participated actively in women's movement in Taiwan. These female interviewees were influenced by their fathers, brothers, friends or special historical incidents in their political enlightenment period. Moreover, many of them had accumulated various political participation experiences before their leadership positions in politics. Besides, most interviewees expressed that anti-authority movement had made great influence for them to enter the political arena (Hsu, 2002: 17).

From Hsu (2002)'s in-depth interview with twenty one female legislators, the results showed that they started their political careers because their ties with

political family, either their families of orientation or their families of procreation. The number of interviewees who took an active initiative in political participation was relatively much lower. Compared with previous female researches in Taiwan, Hsu concluded that factors of women's political participation in Taiwan had not changed much - political families and political summon were still the main proxies. Most interviewees expressed that house-chores and caring responsibilities and negative political culture militated against their political involvement or their running for elected bodies.

### **2.4.2 Family and Political Socialization**

Political socialization is the process by which people learn their attitude, belief and opinions about politics. Political attitudes evolve over time, from a child's belief in noble leaders to an adult's more complex and skeptical view of politics (American Government Lecturer Notes, 2001).

Family has a dominant influence on a child's political socialization. Ranney (1978) claimed that politically active, unified families tended to have more politically active children. He mentioned that parents who discussed public affairs often with their children would increase children's interests and involvement in politics. Moreover, if both parents had the same party affiliation, children tended to adopt it. On the other hand, a fluid family structure (divorces) resulted in a somewhat weaker influence on a child's political socialization (Fan, 1981).

From the above, political elites were supposed to have more chance to discuss political affairs with their family members. However, Taiwan's political culture has changed from the Japanese colonial government (1895-1945), the martial-law period (1947-1987) of Republic of China (R.O.C.) to present political liberalization period. During the colonial period and martial-law period, people didn't have freedom to express their political opinion. Thus the previous studies of Taiwan female political elites, such as Fan (1981) and Chiang (1996), indicated that most interviewees seldom discussed politics with their parents.

Fan (1981) interviewed twenty female members of parliament (MPs). Although most of them with strong political family ties, due to different social expectations between genders, ninety percent of them didn't have any political

learning chance in their childhood. Chiang (1996) interviewed fifteen DPP female political elites and only two mentioned about their political enlightenment deriving from their fathers or brothers while most of her interviewees talked about the influence from their peer groups. Moreover, her research indicated the lack of their mothers' role in their political socialization, which reflected the social context in which women tended to take domestic responsibilities and kept apolitical.

Hsu (2002) interviewed twenty - one female MPs, seven MPs' fathers as politicians, two MPs having political members in their family. These backgrounds had great influence on their political socialization. From her interviews, Hsu found MPs, with a political or better family background, usually had their family's support when they had expressed their interests in joining the election while MPs without a noticeable political backgrounds usually had encountered objections from their parents or had experienced family revolution.

### **2.4.3 Marriage**

Marriage is an important transition period for women to enter the political arena and participate in legislative work. Fan (1981) interviewed twenty female legislators and found some of her interviewees didn't have any interest in politics or had interest in politics but without chance to receive any political training or learning; however, their marriages had changed them. They married into a political family and their parents-in-laws or their spouses influenced them to contact with political affairs and nurtured their ability and interest in political participation.

Marriage has a great influence on women's political socialization. Chou, Clark and Clark, (1992) observed the great influence of the husbands' political activities and support on the old generation (those above 45 years of age) of women politicians in Taiwan. Chiang (1996) interviewed sixteen DPP political elites and concluded three of them were greatly influenced by their husband no matter in their political enlightenment, participation on non-partisan activities or running for election (Hsu, 2002: 19).

Hsu (2002) found among fourteen married MPs, four MPs married to families with political backgrounds. Even apolitical before marriage, they



helped deal with people's petitions or election activities after they got married. Those experiences enabled them to contact a great amount of political information and tasks before their own election. Her case study demonstrated the positive influence on female MPs' socialization from their family life after marriage. However, some of Hsu' interviewees encountered objection from their husbands or their mothers-in-law for fear of jeopardize their original family life once participating in politics. Some MPs had to experience communication and negotiation before participating in politics, which showed that their willingness and insistence allowed them to influence the opposing attitude of their husbands or their husbands' families. Hsu concluded her interviews that women faced much greater obstacles from their husbands' families which didn't have any political ties, while women gained support and encouragement if those MPs had participated in local affairs or served as volunteers for a long term. Hsu's research showed that marriage had a great influence on women's political socialization.

#### **2.4.4 Responsibility of Domestic Work**

Women assume primary family responsibilities, and the role of homemaker is believed to inhibit political participation (Kirkpatrick, 1974). At one extreme is a 1986 German family court case in which the judge ruled that politics and childbearing were incompatible and awarded custody of the child of Green Party executive member Margarete Wolf Mayer to the child's father (UN, 1992: 37-38). It is a confining and isolation role that often denies women access to such political resources as time and contact. It also tends to reinforce men's predominant role in politics. Women face the problem of role-conflicts when they simply do not have time to be actively engaged in politics. Not only lack of time but also women's inability to control their time for political activities constrains women's access to political office. Logically many high-level political women simply choose to remain unmarried. The difficulty that women face in reconciling a political career with family obligations is reflected in the fact that male politicians more often than their female counterparts have small children (UN, 1992: 37-39).

Sapiro (1982), Epstein (1981), and Carroll (1985) discovered that female political participants valued house chores more than male. Their family roles conflicted with their role in politics, thus further influenced the political willingness and behaviors for female (Yung, 2000: 73).

Empirical research on female political participation in Taiwan by Fan (1981), Chou, Clark & Clark (1992), Liang (1993), Chiang (1996) and Peng (1998) indicated that the average age for women to participate in politics was in the range between 40 to 55, which inferred that women had to postpone their political or public affairs participation until their children grew up. In a recent study by Hsu (2002), most of her interviewees still claimed that house chores and childcare were one of their first considerations before stepping into politics. Some of the married interviewees expressed that they had to play their roles as a legislator, a wife, and a mother. However, one third of her interviewees remained single who did not have to worry about childcare while most of other married interviewees had their family support in house chores and childcare, which meant they were free from daily chores to participate in politics. Hence compared with the previous researches in Taiwan (Fan, 1981; Chou, Clark & Clark, 1992; Liang, 1993; Chiang, 1996; Peng, 1998), the average age for women to participate in politics was around 30, which was much younger than the previous researches. Her finding demonstrated if women had less obligation in house-chores and childcare, then it was much likely for women entering politics at an earlier age.

## **2.5 Influence of Political Systems**

### **2.5.1 Electoral Systems**

The electoral systems are most frequently discussed factors among all political factors. Most empirical studies showed that different electoral systems would influence the number of women in parliaments (Norris, 1985; Park, 1999; Paxton & Kunovich, 2003). Park (1999) argued that political opportunity structures were cited as political obstacle to women's election to office. Strong evidence had demonstrated that the presence of a proportional-representation (PR) system such as Sweden and Norway, rather than a simple plurality system (e.g., as in the U.S.), aided women in gaining access to the political system (Lovenduski & Hills, 1981; Norris, 1985; Rule, 1987). Further, proportional-representation-list systems that used party lists were viewed as more favorable still (Kenworthy & Malami, 1999; Matland, 1998).

For instance, women compose more than 40% in the Norway cabinet, which result from a new provision, #21, included in the Equal Status Act in

1981, requiring a 40 percent representation of both sexes on all public boards, councils and committees. This provision serves not only to increase the percentage of women in central government, municipal and county councils and committees in general, but also helps to redress any imbalance in representation on committees where men tend to congregate in “heavy-weight” areas, such as economics, agriculture, communications, technology and defense, while women tend to seek out “soft” areas such as health and care. The “40 percent-rule” was also incorporated in the Local Government Act in 1992 (Norway Government, 1996).

Wilma Rule’s study (1987) on women’s election to the legislature in twenty-three democracies found that the PR system was the major determinant of women’s representation in these countries, even when socio-economic, political, and contextual factors were controlled. Japan had four times more women in the House of Councilors in 1985 with a party list/PR system than in the lower house (House of Representatives), elections for which were held under the single nontransferable vote (Rule 1987, 489). Germany’s hybrid system showed a similar result. When France changed its electoral system from PR to single-member district (SMD) in 1958, the number of women in the national assembly dropped. On the other hand, it was argued that women in Canada, the U.S., and Britain had limited political opportunity due to the SMD system, in spite of their favorable socioeconomic conditions and their significant pool of candidates (Rule 1987, 494) (Park, 1999: 439).

Park (1999) also pointed out that there was a direct relationship between women’s representation and the number of representatives per district: the larger the district, the higher the women’s turnover. The electoral system was the most significant predictor of women’s representation and that the PR system, especially with a larger district size, provided the most political opportunity for women.

Different to PR system, Taiwan adopts a reserved-seats system to protect women’s political participation. Article 134 of the Constitution explicitly specifies a reserved-seats system for women in political elections at all levels. With respect to the Legislative Yuan, Article 4 of the Constitution Amendment specifies that “[in any electoral district], when the number of seats is more than 5 but less than 10, one seat should be reserved for women; if the number of seats exceeds 10, then, for every ten seats, one should be reserved for

women.” With respect to local council elections, Article 33 of the Local Autonomy Law specifies that “in the county and city councils, for every four seats, there should be one reserved for women” (Huang, 2003).

Park (1999) pointed out that the reserved seats system was found the key to significant strides in political participation by women in Taiwan. She regarded this structural incentive system—the reserved seats system, was proving to highly beneficial even in a patriarchal and Confucian society. Women in Taiwan now win far more than their reserved quota, which suggested that women had become competitive political actors on their own.

### **2.5.2 Contests among Political Parties**

Democracy in political parties and electoral systems is crucial in allowing women equal access (Caul, 1999, 2001; Gallagher, 1988; Giele & Smock, 1977; Kohn, 1980; Lovenduski & Hills, 1981). Erickson (1993) discovered that the increases in the number of women candidates nominated by the traditional parties reflected the continuing pressure from women’s groups both inside and outside of the parties for more equitable representation. Also the view within the parties that having more women among their candidates and party caucuses could help them appear to be more women-friendly and thus attract women voters.

Taking advantage of the rapid political liberalization since 1980s, women’s movement organizers agitated for changes in favor of women. For example, DPP (1996) passed one-fourth gender principle in party list in 1996. In 1999, KMT also modified its nomination for nationwide non-district female legislators to adopt one-fourth women quota.

Furthermore, one of the main directions for the KMT’s internal reforms since the loss of power in 2000 has been to expand the political participation of women and minority groups. At the party congress convened in June 2000, Cheng-chi Lin was elected the first vice chairwoman in the history of the party. In addition, the percentage of women in the newly elected Central Standing Committee exceeded 35%. This has had a significant impact on the image of the KMT, since prior to this the percentage of women in the Central Standing Committee had rarely exceeded 10%. In the meantime, the number of female members in the Central Standing Committee of the DPP has never exceeded two, since the founding of the party. The percentage, however, remained higher

than that of the KMT until the year 2000, because the DPP's Central Standing Committee had fewer members than that of the KMT (Huang, 2003).

### **2.5.3 Lack of Political Opportunity**

A preponderance of studies on the employment distribution of women and men, and the integration of women into the administrative ranks provides evidence that women often face glass ceilings and glass walls at the federal and state levels (Baron & Newman, 1989; Bullard & Wright, 1993; Cornwell & Kellough, 1994; Crum & Naff, 1997; Kellough, 1989; Lewis & Emmert, 1986; Lewis & Nice, 1994; Mani, 1997; Naff & Thomas, 1994; Newman, 1994; Preffer & Davis-Blake, 1987) (Kerr, Miller, and Reid, 2000: 412).

Job development would enhance qualifications, gender-biased culture and stereotypes, outright discrimination, and the distribution of opportunities and power all might contribute (Kerr, Miller, and Reid 2000). However, female cabinet-level appointees have experienced disadvantages, not only in the number but also in access to different positions (Peng, 2000).

Lewis and Nice (1994) found that women employed in state and local governments are heavily overrepresented in public welfare, housing, and health, and men are overrepresented in the streets and highways, sanitation and sewage, utilities and transportation, fire, and police functions. This is consistent with Bayes (1991) who found that federal-level employment rates for women differed by policy area of the agency and its relationship to traditional sex roles in the workplace. Finance positions tended to be male-dominated, and women were predominantly employed in health and education departments (Bayes, 1991).

Women in Taiwan government as well find it's hard to have access into top-ranking positions, not to mention lacking chances to accumulate their political experiences in policy-making. Huang (2003) pointed out that there were no female cabinet members prior to 1989. Although the percentage of female cabinet members exceeded 20% for the first time after the 2000 Presidential Election and the transfer of power to the DPP, the percentage of women remains low in other presidential appointee positions such as grand justices, and members of both the Examination Yuan and the Control Yuan. Of these presidential appointees, the number of female grand justices was the

lowest, at less than 10%.

## 2.6 Other Factors

### 2.6.1 Ideological Factors

Ideological factor is a commonly hypothesized explanation for female office-holding (Kenworthy & Malami, 1999; Paxton, 1997; Reynolds, 1999). Ideological attitudes about women's role and position in society can influence women's political participation (Arceneaux, 2001; Giele & Smock 1977; Kohn, 1980; McCammon et al., 2001; Paxton, 1997). Ideology is not diffuse or abstract. Ideologies and arguments against women having the right to participate in politics created very substantial barriers to women's participation for centuries. Western political theorists such as Aristotle, Rousseau, Hobbes, and Locke justified the exclusion of women from politics due to their assumed non-rational nature (Paxton, 1997: 446).

Women were portrayed as inferior in reasoning and intellect in world literature. Such negative attitudes about women in politics continued even after women gained suffrage. Paxton and Kunovich (2003) pointed out that in the Inter-Parliamentary Union (IPU) study of female politicians, a negative ideology is cited more often than any other reason to explain low female participation in politics<sup>2</sup>.

In fact, in many countries, traditions continue to emphasize and often dictate, women's primary role as mothers and housewives. A traditional, strong, patriarchal value system favors sexually segregated roles and so-called "traditional cultural values" militate against the advancement, progress and participation of women in any political process (Shvedova, 1998). For example,

---

<sup>2</sup>For example, a respondent from Central America states, "the patriarchal ideology prevailing in our society is the biggest stumbling block we have to face." Another respondent, from Central Europe, contrasts an ideological explanation with socio-economic and political factors:

In spite of a long tradition of active participation in the workforce by a vast majority of women, both women and men see motherhood and marriage as the most important goals in a woman's life. A common standpoint is that "politics is a man's business," and that women are too emotional to deal with affairs of the state. The reasons for this are not to be found in education, with women in ( my country ) being as educated as their male counterparts. It is simply because of the stereotyped and traditional structure of society.(IPU 2000a:20)

in some African societies, it is not acceptable for a woman to run for office in the area where she lives with her husband as this would imply that she rules the village of her husband, a violation of traditional roles (UN, 1992: 37).

Besides, some studies (Norris, 1985; Paxton & Kunovich, 2003; UN, 1992) showed that women were discriminated against by voters and by the political elite merely because of their sex. The voter discrimination explanation of women's under-representation pointed out that women face prejudice on the part of voters: voters tended to perceive women as less qualified than men to hold public office and as single-issue candidates who were concerned only with women's issues (Park, 1999: 436). A survey by Darcy, Welch, and Clark (1994) in the U.S. showed, even as late as 1991, that a quarter of the respondents agreed that most men were better suited for politics than women. Paxton and Kunovich (2003) used data from a worldwide survey, which collected individual-level information on gender attitudes in forty-six countries in Europe, North America, Eastern Europe, South America, Asia and Africa and found the aggregated variable "men are better in politics" was highly significant, with a strong negative impact on women's representation in national legislatures. Thus, they demonstrated ideology strongly predicted differences in women's political representation.

Although traditional Chinese society is not the only male-dominated one in the world, it has one of the longest histories of oppression in terms of both form and ideology. The concepts such as "man is superior to women", "people need to carry their family line", "bring up sons to support parents in their old ages", and "men are mater and responsible for activities outside the household, while women are obedient and responsible only for household affairs" are deeply rooted in Chinese cultural tradition. Nowadays, receiving higher education and finding a good job is the life plan most common to women in Taiwan, but many complain that they are still burdened with traditional roles. For instance, the working rate of women in Taiwan stabilized at around 45 percent during the past ten years after reaching 40 percent in 1983 - and about 59 percent of those who did not work said they quitted working due to "housework," according to the Council for Economic Planning and Development and the Cabinet-level Directorate General of Budget, Accounting and Statistics (The China Post, 1999).

Chou & Clark (1986) found the traditional stereotype in Taiwan enhanced

the prejudice of voters on women's ability in politics. Average voters based on "Politics is men's game while house chores are women's business" thought women politicians cannot handle political affairs. Cultural norms can limit women's opportunities to participate in politics (Rule & Zimmerman, 1994). Li (1989) surveyed Taipei and Tainan female citizens, who regarded that the biggest obstacle in women's political participation was "the dual burden of family and career". She pointed out that female respondents expressed if they couldn't correspond to balance family life with the demands of work, they would choose to abandon career and put family as their first priority.

## **2.6.2 Socio-Economic Factors**

Women's participation in politics cannot be isolated from their overall socio-economic status, the following factors in particular: Women usually do not have equal access with men to the means for participation, such as the enabling skills acquired through education and training or controlling the means of production or access to the information media, including the new communications technologies. For this very reason, they have not been able to overcome gender biases that obstruct their access to political decision-making (UNDP, 2000: 8). According to previous cross-national research, low levels of female participation in the legislature are thought to result from two factors: the "supply" of female candidates and "demand" for female candidates (Norris, 1997; Randall, 1987). Supply is determined by structural factors such as educational level, professional experience and levels of income.

### **a. Education**

Norris (1985) points out that educated citizens are more likely to follow current events in the media, to acquire political issues and to be politically efficacious. UN (1992), which concerned the issue that women in politics and decision-making in the late twentieth century by a meeting with scholars and political practitioners, claimed education was one of the greatest forces for change in women's lives because it influences women's chances of obtaining paid employment, her age at marriage, her control over childbearing, her exercise of legal and political rights and her chance of acquiring political power.

For instance, in Japan, there has been a light increase in the political participation of women. One of the reasons given was the improved access of



women to higher education. Since the mid-1950s the number of girls in Japan attending senior high school, college and university has been increasing. The more education women receive, the stronger is their sense of social participation, particularly in terms of locating job opportunities or engaging in voluntary service outside the home (UN, 1992: 35).

### **b. Occupation Status**

Norris (1985) pointed out that political elites tended to be drawn from a small number of occupational groups. Lawyers, journalists, academics, teachers and businessmen were statistically over-represented in parliaments. These occupational backgrounds provided women with expertise and confidence in public speaking, knowledge of government and familiarity with the law, as well as considerable flexibility in combining a long-term professional career with the demands and uncertainties of public office.

Another reason is that elected office can thus be complementary, rather than antithetical, to the careers of many professionals, since political experience provides lawyers, businessmen and journalists with a range of useful contacts. Moreover, the high status of these occupations may favorably influence selectorates which choose party candidates. For these reasons, the limited number of women in these occupations means that they are at a clear numerical disadvantage in standing for office. As more women enter law, the media and business, however, more may climb the ladder to public office (Norris, 1985: 96).

Huang (2003) analyzed “Women and political participation” in Taiwan by empirical data. She claimed that the improvement of women’s education and socioeconomic status had contributed to the growing percentage of Taiwanese women participating in politics.

However, Kenworthy & Malami, (1999) and Paxton (1997) claimed educational achievements or general measures of the share women in the paid labor force did not predict women’s representation in their cross-national studies. Specific measures of relevant occupations, such as the percentage of women in professional or managerial professions, produce significant effects in some studies (Kenworthy & Malami, 1999) but insignificant ones in others (Paxton, 1997). Despite advances in women’s levels of education and participation in the paid economy over the past 20 years (Clark, Ramsbey &

Adler, 1991; Jacobs, 1996), women have made little significant progress with respect to their representation in national politics. Thus, some feminist scholars had attempted to explain the reasons for women's low participation from other perspectives, such as electoral systems and ideological factors.

This chapter begins an important dialogue on the definition of political participation and the definition of political appointees. It continues with the various feminist theories and the various factors that serve to explain or predict female demographic profile in top-ranking political appointees in Taiwan. Politics is the authoritative allocation of values for a society. However, women have been marginalized in political participation for thousands and hundreds of years. In order to redress such situation, the presence of women in appointed position is important, because it can enhance bureaucratic responsiveness to the broad array of female interests embodied in the general public. In this sense, women may have a greater chance of benefiting from public policies to the degree they are reflected in top-level positions in governmental organizations.

## Chapter 3 Research Design

There are broadly two major approaches to study female political participation: quantitative approach and qualitative approach (Reinharz, 1992; Travers; 2001). The most frequently used qualitative research method in literature, e.g., Chiang 1996, Fan, 1981; Hsu 2002; Li, 1989; Peng, 1998, is in-depth interview while the most frequently used quantitative research methods in literature, e.g., Escobar-Lemmon & Taylor-Robinson, 2003; Norris, 1985; Park, 1999; Paxton & Kunovich, 2003, is the regression method. Reinharz (1992) also pointed out that some feminist studies used both methods in their researches, such examples including Chou and Clark (1992), Shvedova (1998) and UN (1992).

Previous studies (Chiang, 1996; Fan, 1981; Hsu, 2002; Peng, 1998;) used in-depth interviews to provide empirical evidences that women in Taiwan were less active in political arena. In Taiwan's feminist literature, there is a dearth of feminist studies on female political appointees. This research uses in-depth interviews to understand what takes place in their process of being appointed and how they overcome the obstacles against their political participation because in-depth interviewing differs from ethnography in not including long periods of researcher participation in the life of the interviewee and differs from survey research or structured interviewing by including free interaction between the researcher and interviewee.

Interviewing needs much preparation in advance. Hence, the researcher collected second-hand data of our interviewees from newspapers, magazines, books, internet, and interviewees' secretaries.

### 3.1 Sampling

With the young democratization of Taiwan, Taiwan does not have a unified law to regulate the political appointment system. Therefore, the regulations are shown in different acts. Political appointed positions within departments of the Taiwan Government are listed in Article II of Political Appointee Pension Act as discussed in Chapter Two (See Appendix I).

This thesis applies the above definition of political appointee to conduct survey on the top-level positions that are politically appointed. Ministers,

Directors of Bureau, and Secretary-General that are political appointed are on the list of this research's subject.

This research started to set up a database including their personal information, related reports and books for targeted female political appointees in Taiwan during October to November 2003. Initially, the researcher visited national governmental websites respectively to scrutinize for female political appointees. In this stage, the researcher searched out 43 top-ranking female government officials, including Ministers, Secretary-General Ministers in central government and Directors of Bureau in local governments. In the following month, the researcher called their personnel administration departments to confirm their position because in Taiwan some directors of Bureau are career civic servants instead of political appointees. Each is an individual case in respective local government; thus, the researcher needed to check out county by county. We finally concluded that in the 2003 Taiwan government, 18 top-rank female political appointees sat in the central and local cabinets, including Minister, Vice Minister, Secretary-General and Directors in local government (See Appendix II). The only one female vice Minister was included because she represented the ruling government in her Ministry and had great influence on policies within her Ministry; however, the researcher did not include vice Commissioners on Central government because Commissioners is the one who decides the direction of the Commission. The researcher also excluded female ministers without portfolio because they were not responsible to specific directions of government agencies.

### **3.2 Interview Questions**

Our in-depth interview is primarily based on interview outline, which was based on previous interview outlines of female in-depth interviews researches of Peng (1998) and Hsu (2002). The first and the eighth part of the outline aim to understand factors influencing their political participation. The second part aims to understand their impact upon their arrival. The third, sixth and ninth parts aim to understand the difference between female political appointees and male political appointees from interviewees' perspective and observation. The fourth part aims to understand the obstacles women face as serving on top-rank officials. The fifth part aims to understand the important role of female political appointees in carry out their duty. The last part of this outline aims to find out

solutions of women's low participation in politics from these successful women in politics.

### **Interview Outline**

- I. The process of serving as political appointee  
Achievement factors:  
Personal motive/characteristics  
Reference groups: supportive family and friends  
Personal capability: professional skills or working experiences  
Environment: laws, politics (nomination by president, mayors), social values  
Others: election culture
- II. The main policy, achievements, and future focus
- III. Compared with male political appointees, any difference in human resources or budget?
- IV. The frequent difficulty and obstacles in policy implement and suggested solutions
- V. The interaction between other cabinets and Legislative Yuan (Central political appointees)  
  
The interaction between other bureaus and local council (Local political appointees)
- VI. Compared to male political appointees, do you have any advantages or disadvantages as a female political appointee?  
If there is any difference in policy implement between male and female political appointees? If any, what is the difference?
- VII. Family's attitude toward serving as a political appointee
- VIII. The impact of serving as a female political appointee, personal changes and growth, and future expectations  
Life plan and feeling of political participation

IX. Perspectives of female serving as political appointees

X. Policy to encourage women in political participation and public affairs

### **3.3 Interview Process**

Female political appointees have a tight schedule. After continuous requests, we had succeeded in interviewing sixteen female political appointees from January to May in 2004, eight in central government while the others at local governments. The interviewee name list of the central government includes:

1. Tsai Ying-wen, last chairwoman of Mainland Affairs Council (MAC)
2. Liou Shih Fang, last Secretary-General of the Executive Yuan
3. Chen Chu, chairwoman of the Council of Labor Affairs
4. Lin Fang-mei, last Minister of National Youth Commission
5. Fan Sun-lu, Deputy Minister of Education
6. Kuo Yao-chi, Minister of State & Chairperson of Public Construction Commission
7. Yeh Chu-lan, last Minister of the Council for Hakka Affairs
8. Chen Yu-chiou, last Chairwoman of the Cultural Affairs Council.

We also interviewed local female political appointees as follows:

1. Ku Yenlin, commissioner of the Department of Social Welfare, Taipei City Government
2. Chang Ming-jue, chairperson of the Administrative Appeals Commission, Taipei City Government
3. Kuan Bi-ling, Director of the Department of Cultural Affairs of Kaohsiung City Government
4. Shie Yun-jiau, chairperson of the Research, Development and Evaluation Commission of Kaohsiung City Government
5. Chen Jin Bao, Director of Legal Affairs Bureau of Kaohsiung City Government
6. Wu Li-hsueh, director of the Bureau of Social Affairs, Kaohsiung County Government
7. Yang Shiou-bi, director of the Bureau of Social Affairs, Tainan County Government

8. Tu Yi-chuan, director of the Bureau of Social Affairs, Bingtung County Government.

Before every interview, we informed interviewed female political appointees our interview outline by e-mail, mail, telephone or fax. If needed, we also explained our questions or adjusted our outline after discussion with their secretaries. Meanwhile, in order to gain more credibility and invite the interviewee to speak, we developed a more reflective approach: understanding interviewee's background data from senior political journalist, collecting related reports of the interviewee from internet articles, books, newspapers and magazines.

Every interview was conducted one to one in female political appointees' offices. The shortest interview lasted 45 minutes, while the longest one lasted more than 3 hours. Before our interview got started, we explained our research topic and research purposes to our interviewee again. We also asked their permission to record our interview. After the permission of the interviewee, the researcher started to ask their experiences of serving as female political appointees, their growing backgrounds, and their opinions of women in politics according to our interview outline. Sometimes our interviewees couldn't express their past achievements and policies fully; they would offer related documents, articles and books to us on the spot or they asked their secretaries to provide us necessary data later on.

After the interview, the researcher typed out the interview results. In order to protect the privacy of our interviewees, this research used the letter of A--P to present and indicate their individual political experiences and opinions.

## Chapter 4 Female Appointees in Taiwan

This research focused on factors of female appointees to participate in politics and successfully interviewed sixteen female appointees. In this chapter, we discuss our research results and findings in personal motive, political socialization, and political opportunities, and other factors in order to find out their political participating factors.

### 4.1 Personal Motive and Other Personal Factors

#### 4.1.1 Personal Motive

There are different kinds of personal motives. From our interviews, we find the reasons that our interviewees are willing to participate in politics include (1) fulfilling their ambition and dreams; (2) developing interests in politics through grass-root activities; (3) developing interests in politics through work.

##### (1) Fulfilling their ambition

When talking about their personal experiences of becoming a political appointee, although they were appointed by the president or mayors/magistrates, most of them expressed their desires of such jobs because as political appointees they could decide or influence policy and carry out their ambition:

*“This is an opportunity for me to change what I thought was not good into better and to put theory into realization” (O).*

*“I accepted this job because I have fought for human rights and this job can help disadvantaged people as well” (L).*

*“My friends and I went into streets to ask for educational reform...Then I represented DPP to serve as non-district legislator and made or revised a lot of educational laws. Now it’s time for me to represent the ruling party to put those laws into practice” (K).*

*“To carry out the dream shared by my husband and me” (J).*



*“I participated in the stipulation of the new appealing law, so I have great expectation on this job” (H).*

*“To do something for this county” (G).*

*“Working in government and making policies is a great way to change this world” (F).*

Addition to eleven interviewees expressed that they wanted to carry out their ambition and serve people; three took it as work, while interviewee B took this post, which is her second appointment, for democracy movement:

*“How I got appointed is because I have participated in democracy movement since 1983. I participated in Tangwai movement and later I participated in the foundation of DPP. I lobbied for many politicians, such as Kang Ning-hsiang, Chen Shui-bian, Prof. Peng Ming-min, and Mayor Hsieh Chang-ting. All these years I served in academics, but also participated in democracy movement. Meanwhile, I served as member of DPP Central Executive Commission twice. The first term was because Chen Shui-bian supported me and this term was because of Mayor Hsieh...It's probably because of those experiences that Mayor Hsieh invited me to join their team in 2000. The reason that I joined their team is purely for the democracy movement consideration. Because in January of 2000, I felt it wouldn't be a problem for President Chen to get elected. At that time I felt among the DPP politicians, Mayor Hsieh was the one that was more suitable for my assistance. Thus I came to Kaohsiung” (B).*

Interviewee B devoted to democracy movement when she was young. In fact, interviewee N, L, K had also devoted to liberalization movement since they were young.

Interviewee N, one of “three queens in New Trend faction of DPP”, was interested in politics and public affairs because a lot of Tangwai activists delivered speech in her neighborhood and her parents sometimes would listen to their speeches. Moreover, when she went abroad for further study, she saw how democracy flourished in the United States. She realized that someone has to do something for democracy in Taiwan. She said,

*“In the next year after I came back to Taiwan, the martial law was lifted. After my return to Taiwan, I devoted mainly to anti-nuclear movement. I served as the*

*executive member of “Environmental Protection Association”, assistance of parliament, and campaign assistant. I had also written articles. At that time all I had was a gush of enthusiasm. Although at the beginning the salary was only \$10,000/\$20,000 dollars and I had to cover a lot of transportation fees to run lobbies, although at that time DPP only composed a dozen posts in the legislative Yuan and I had to face the uncertain future, for the love of politics I went through it all the way” (N).*

Interviewee K also participated in politics actively since a graduate student. Out of personal interests, she chose politics as her major and knew some famous professors who advocated democracy and political liberalization. Outside the classroom, she enjoyed to pick up extensive reading in politics. Chen Chu, one of our interviewee, introduced her and her husband to many Tangwai members and they lobbied for Tangwai politicians since their student lives. Her path to involvement in politics is a kind of self-realization.

*“Actually I like politics very much. Politics is to manage public affairs. In this field, it uses a broad perspective to see things, such as looking at the development of history, the operation of politics, and electoral systems. In fact, the core value of politics is democracy, liberty, laws and human rights. I felt delighted to study politics and read book by myself to discover things which my teachers wouldn’t tell me at class. At that time we had some very nice professors in the Tung-hai University. For instance, Lee Chung-ning was the author of “Liberal China” and our Dean Tu Heng-chih was an expert of international laws and Lee Ya-ling was also our teacher. Therefore, they always brought us new information. I continued to study at Institute of Politics after my graduation, and it was at that time, I got acquaintance with Tangwai members by my institute classmate. I knew Kang Ning-hsiang first and he introduced me to Chen Chu...” (K).*

## **(2) Developing Interests in Politics through Grass-root Activities**

Ten interviewees expressed they had participated actively in grass-root activities for a long time before they got appointed: B, K, L, N in liberalization movement as mentioned above, A, E, F in women movement, C, K in educational reform and D, J in community activities. Table 4.1. shows the categories of grass-root activities that our interviewees participated in actively. Except interviewee J, who participated in community activities partly because of her husband, those interviewees showed great personal interests in grass-root activities.

Table 4.1. Grass-root Activities of Interviewees

Grass-root activities	Interviewee
Liberalization movement	B, K, L, N
Women movement	A, E, F
Educational reform	C, K
Community activities	D, J

Interviewee F was a woman of vision and movement organizer. The person she admired most was Liang, Chi-chao in senior-high school days, so reform was always her dream. Reform was very appealing to her. But she studied in foreign languages and literature, which was very apolitical. She regained interests in public affairs because feminist movement and feminist studies since the early 1970s, when an American friend lent her a copy of Robin Morgan's *Sisterhood is Powerful in Claremont, California*, which provoked her to think about women's status. Margery Wolf's *Women and the Family in Rural Taiwan* was another book that taught her to rethink what she was familiar. Feminist studies, the legalization of abortion, equality and protection for women in the labor market and at home was flourished by her and other feminists in the 1990s. She, who always encouraged women to participate in politics, said,

*"I knew the Bureau of Social Affairs covered a lot of affairs. I felt it was a tough task...But I am always interested in social policies. Because doing Women's studies, we hoped some issues in private spheres to be publicized and politicized, and to influence government's decisions. Because we think men have gender-blindness in policy-decision. We hope to instill women's perspective in decision-making. Thus, I hope to grasp this opportunity to exert the influence of policy" (F).*

Interviewee A, a sociology and communications scholar, was a co-founder of a famous women's organization, a liaison between the feminist theories and the women's movement. She resigned her full professor position and accepted this appointment to continue what she thinks is right. She joined DPP after she got appointed. She expressed,

*"My stance of political party is very clear and moderate. I joined DPP could help the general public have a different image of DPP" (A).*

In 2004, interviewee A got her second political appointment. Although she

did not seek to participate in politics while she was a professor, she did grasp every chance to exert herself in any political appointment position. Interviewee E studied laws out of her father's expectation. In her student days, she didn't join any clubs because she spent most of her time in part-time jobs. After her graduation, she served as a protonotary and a public prosecutor. In 1989, Wu-Su Case happened and many women's groups supported her. After that incident, she and her husband left their positions and became independent lawyers and started a new left to participate in women's organization. During her spared time, she likes to join in church's activities and lecture around campus or organizations. She had denied chances to serve as DPP non-district legislator because of "bad election culture", but this time she accepted this post because:

*"This is a great time to transform the vision we used to accumulate in private organizations into implementation" (E).*

### **(3) Developing Interests in Politics through Work**

Some of our interviewees, who did not actively participate in grass-root activities, showed less interested in politics. They developed their knowledge of political participation through their work.

*"I studied law because of my father's expectation....Actually, I do not have any particular interest, and maybe it's because of my jobs. The main reason for me to participate in public affairs is because I served as advisor of trade negotiation. In the process of participation in public affairs I had many chances to know the operation of our government" (P).*

*"I have never been interested in politics (laughing). What happened in your life sometimes is out of your control. Of course someone would say "I want to become a president" in their childhood, but I didn't have such ambition. Therefore, I think it might be "fate", which arranged me into such path" (O).*

*"I majored in politics because I didn't do well in my entrance exam. I fooled around at my university days and while I was at the political center, I just did poll survey and did not have particular interest in politics. It was not until I came to city government that I started to develop my interest in public affairs. At that time, I was sure that this is my interest. In fact, my interest in public affairs started very late. It was almost at my thirty" (I).*

*“I didn’t think too much. I only felt that this is within my profession field and this is a new challenge. No particular...it was a surprised change in my life...” (H).*

In conclusion, most of female appointees expressed their expectations in our society, thus they participated in grass-root activities long before getting appointment. Their attitude toward politics are much active than other interviewees who did not actively participate in grass-root activities but developed their interests in politics and their knowledge of politics through work.

### **4.1.2 Family and Political Socialization**

Political socialization is a process in which a person develops his/her political attitude and behavior. This section discusses the impact that family has on our interviewees’ political socializations.

Fifteen female political appointees in Taiwan didn’t grow up in political family. Most of them said,

*“My parents had never talked about politics before they were in their fifties” (A).*

*“No, my family provided me almost no political background...” (F).*

*“Because my parents are somewhat conservative, they always keep some distance to political affairs. Hence they didn’t pay special attention to politics or public affairs, and they didn’t have special expectation on their kids. Their focus was on our studies” (P).*

*“My father was an artist in Japanese colonial period. He was somewhat against such colonial control. Later KMT government came to Taiwan and after the 28 February Incident, they were angry but they didn’t say it” (J).*

Similar to the interview of interviewee C, *“My parents’ expectation was very simple. That is to study, to graduate, to find a job, and then OK!”* For most Taiwanese parents, the only expectation they have on their children is to study and have a stable job. Some parents of our interviewees were apolitical. Even though interviewee L’s grandfather and father helped Tangwai members in

election and interviewee N's parents sometimes listened to Tangwai members' speeches, the greatest expectation for their children was still to be a teacher or have a stable life. When interviewee N's and K's parents found their daughter participated in Tangwai activities, they were very worried about their daughters' safety.

When interviewee A heard of the 28 February Incident from her university classmate, she felt very curious about this event and after she came home, she asked her parents what happened at that time. Her parents went startled and questioned her why she asked so. She mentioned,

*“My father was a civic employee. He saw his colleague was taken away and never came back...For us, the White Horror is only an atmosphere, but for them, they really saw their colleagues to be taken away. Therefore, they were very painful in the period of martial laws” (A).*

Most of our interviewees' parents served as civic workers, businessmen, labors, and teachers. Their parents did not have close involvement in politics, except that the fathers of interviewee L and C had helped others run election. Studies of female politicians, such as Fan (1981) and Chiang (1996), demonstrated that most female politicians seldom discussed politics with their parents. The only exception is interviewee L. The clear political attitude and connection of interviewee L's family had influenced her political attitude, and even her life. She later worked for a Tangwai politician and went on the road of Tangwai movement. In short, although most interviewees do not have any political background, the greatest expectations on our interviewees from interviewees' parents are to study hard and contribute what they learn at school to our society, which established our interviewees' capabilities to receive their political posts. As interviewee H, whose parents were civic workers in Taiwan Train Station, said,

*“My parents expected kids able to apply what they have learned in their profession. “It is easy to cultivate yourself in government organizations.” You can do many things; hence, they hoped me to develop in this field. Then I studied in laws and administration. It seems that working in public sector was the most directly applicable of my major. Therefore, I worked in government. Basically, I had quite achievement to work in government. You spent a period of time to be involved in public affairs and make a system to be formed. Then the whole country can get benefits from that. I felt quite a sense of achievement!” (H).*

Our interview finds that family members of our interviewees agreed them to receive their appointments, except interviewee J for her health concern. Many family members provided our interviewees unconditional practical support and encouragement. Despite some parents thought such position would bring some inconveniences for them, such as privacy, and it belongs to an exhausting job, many parents still felt very proud of our interviewees to attain such posts.

### **4.1.3 Marriage**

#### **a. Married interviewees with children**

Feminists have argued that the family is the main way in which women are oppressed. Women are seen as responsible for the majority of domestic work and for the care and control of their children. Abbott and Wallace (1990) pointed out married women are more likely than single women or than single men to suffer from mental illness because ‘they are buffer and absorber of stresses of the other members of the family’.

Most of our interviewees with children expressed that they are very lucky to have their relatives to help them in house chores and childcare. Some of them referred their husbands were delighted to share with the house chores and childcare. Furthermore, some of their children have learned to be independent and take care of themselves or even their parents.

However, interviewee C expressed that her husband didn’t like to do the house chores and thought doing the house chore was a favor for his wife. Ann Oakley (1982) has argued that even men share child care and domestic tasks, men are generally said to be ‘helping’ their wives. Women are held responsible if essential tasks are not carried out, and men will frequently ‘make do’ for meals if their wives are absent (Abbott and Wallace, 1990). To liberal women from such oppression in marriage, we need to challenge such chauvinist concept and instill the concept of the equal responsibility of house chores and childcare between two sexes.

#### **b. Unmarried interviewees**

In patriarchal society, girls grow up expecting and wanting to get married, seeing the wedding day as the supreme moment of their lives. Single women are thought to be in need of the protection of a man, and this is an additional

pressure towards marriage. It is generally assumed that women will get married and have children. Women who choose not to do so are seen as strange, as unnatural (Abbott and Wallace, 1990).

Four interviewees in our research are unmarried. Interviewees in forties and fifties faced the choice of being single with easiness, but our youngest interviewee “I” expressed she realizes that she probably would miss her marriage if she accepted this post.

*“I probably could not get married. I think when you served as a chairperson, no body would dare to court you. In fact, I know that I probably have to devote more time in my job, especially that I am single. Our congressmen joked, “Chairperson X, they said you are still single. We believe you can devote much energy to our city.” Therefore, for them, they think it’s best for a female chairperson to be single because she doesn’t need to spare her time to take care of her family. When I received this post, I knew that my personal life would decrease and I have to spend a lot of time in work.” (I).*

The general public usually takes it for granted that men are strong, and tough, and should be ‘bread-winners’, and that women are submissive, gentle and should be ‘carers’. Interviewee I suffered from such patriarchal ideology. Besides worries about her excellence, she had taken pregnancy and mothering into consideration.

*“As a female chairperson, I dare not to give birth to a baby. For male chairperson, if he likes to have a baby, he can ask his wife to have a baby and take care of his child. He can enjoy the happiness of having a child. But as a female, if I got married and received such post, it would be impossible for me to have a baby and take maternity leave in my term” (I).*

As studies (Kirkpatrick, 1974; UN, 1992; Yung, 2000) have indicated that the dual role often denies women access to such political resources as time and contact and it tends to reinforce men’s predominant role in politics, logically many high-level political women have to sacrifice their marriage and simply choose to remain unmarried. Furthermore, UN (1992) pointed out that the difficulty that women face in reconciling a political career with family obligations is reflected in the fact that male politicians more often than their female counterparts have small children. The feeling and choice of Interviewee I highlighted the different relationships to pregnancy, childbirth, lactation and



childcare between male and female political appointees.

Among our twelve married interviewees, four of them have a political spouse. The political lives of three DPP female appointees in Taiwan were triggered by their husbands' political activities and support. They claimed that the influence from husbands was enormous. Interviewee M was a successful manager of commercial advertisement company before stepping into politics. She said,

*“In fact my growing background is completely similar to the general. I graduated from school and taught more than one year, and then worked in advertisement field. My husband was always editing for “Liberty Weekly.” He stated that Taiwan is an independent country and people should have the freedom of speech. He agitated the authoritative because he published an article...To Taiwanese people and to me, I felt because his heroic sacrifice, I could not continue what was called “self-deceived” bourgeois work. Therefore, I chose to participate in politics. At that time, I was very clear that one grain falling into the ground would grow more wheat!” (M).*

Interviewee J was a famous pianist and professor. She met her husband when studying in France. Her husband totally changed her life. She said,

*“The reason that I accepted this post (the chairwoman of this council) is because of my husband. Because my husband was very close to people, though a professional pianist, I accompanied him in his legislative terms or in his election campaigns for ten years. I held 50 volunteer concerts to introduce music, instruments, and painting each year in 29 countries and towns of Taipei County...Before receiving this post, I always used culture to do social work. Because of this, I walked into people's lives from a pianist who performed music in a concert hall. The professionalism of being a pianist and performing at national music hall around the world is my life ambition. But being with my husband to every corner of country and village, and being able to use music to communicate with others are my greatest pleasure. I felt what I gave was less than what I received. I also benefited a lot from communicating with people and changed my life philosophy. Therefore, after my husband passed away, I took this position. Some part of the reason is to fulfill our shared dream” (J).*

Interviewee B was a political professor. She was once a star student that KMT wanted to cultivate. She said,

*“First, it was my husband that brought me from thoughts of (KMT) party and (R.O.C.) nation into the system of philosophy and politics. He grew up in Tangwai environment. He grew up in a family with a political criminal, so he himself encouraged me to walk in this path all the way. He pushed me because I came from a rural place and I didn’t have big ambition. I got a PhD. degree and got involved in public politics. I personally did not have such intention and my husband became the essential motivation” (B).*

Interviewee K also has a political spouse, but unlike interviewee M, J, B, she had been involved in politics before meeting her husband. She expressed,

*“My husband was my mate of Tangwai movement. He devoted in the magistrate election of Chungli incident in 1977, and I had already helped Tangwai elections in 1975. At that time, the most interesting part was the gathering of all the Taiwan youth. Several here, several there, and we got together to visit around and lobby for others. I felt those things were very interesting and full of fun!” (K).*

Besides interviewee M, J, B, K with a political spouse, other eight married interviewees did not marry into a political family. Although their husbands were not politicians or they didn’t have a close relationship with politicians, their understanding and support had been a very important requirement for our interviewees to serve as political appointees. Because female political appointees have to bear the hectic pace of life and sacrifice many family gatherings and family life. Interviewee F felt pity that her husband lived alone in Hsin-chu,

*“He always supports me! For example, I came to Taipei to work and he lives in Hsin-chu. It was a great impact of our family life for him. Every time I see old lonely people, I felt that he is so poor. But he is always very supportive. He thought I should do what I want to do” (F).*

Besides the consideration from their spouses, interviewee O and C expressed their husbands were very good consultants while they met tough tasks. Interviewee C even claimed that she was a student of her husband (in terms of public affairs participation) because her husband encouraged her serving as director of teachers’ association and as appointee.

In respect of family support, most parents-in-law could understand the

hardship of their daughters-in-law and realize time to be with their daughters-in-law has been condensed because of serving as political appointees. Some parents-in-law even provide practical help in house chores and childcare. In the other aspect of parent-children relationship, not every child supports his/ or her mother to serve as political appointees. For example, the adult children of interviewee J oppose their mother to serve as political appointee out of her health concern. After communication, they finally agreed to let their mother to serve as appointee to fulfill the dream and hope of their parents. Moreover, interviewee D talked about a past conflict between her and her daughter.

*“One day my daughter went to cram school. When she wanted to come home, it rained heavily. Other children’s parents went to take them, but hers didn’t. She ran home while the rain was pouring. She was very angry and very sad and cried in her room. I said to her, “You should learn how to deal with daily business, right? Like today, you could call home and ask whether there was any adult home to help you. However, you just came home without an umbrella, which meant you didn’t handle it very well, right? Moreover, concerning this task and the role of my job, I said “I am different from other mothers, and we had communicated this before. You said you supported me to serve as such post...” Yeah, I used this kind of process to communicate with my children, and during this process conflict was inevitable” (J).*

In summary of this section, in the process of political socialization, many interviewees’ husbands play an important role in enlightening, supporting and discussing. On the other hand, their parents-in-law are proud of their daughter-in-law as political appointee. For interviewees who play the role of mother, some get best wishes and support from their children, while some had faced complaints from their children and struggled with their children time after time. It shows that as soon as a female political appointee chooses to shoulder such heavy-load job, she might have to go through a hard time to communicate and negotiate with her children.

#### **4.1.4 Responsibility of Domestic Work**

The personal is the political. As motherhood has been an extensively discussed issue no matter in the private sphere or the public sphere. In our interviews, we found that nine of our interviewees have children. The children of interviewee M and J are adults so they do not have to worry about

childrearing. But for seven interviewees, they have teenager kids to take care of. Interviewee H and interviewee O even once tried to quit their jobs to be a full-time housewife. All of those interviewees with children either have relatives to help them in child caring or hire a nanny to do the house chores.

*“I am very lucky because my parents always help me take care of my three children and I even don’t have to take the role of a housewife, especially in recent years. They almost take every task to do; therefore, I am very fortunate that my parents almost unconditionally support me” (O).*

*“This is certainly an important point! Because I am a career woman all the time, my principle is to take care of both my family and work. As a result, I have made some arrangements. For example, my family had to share the load, since they supported me. However, there was something you could exceed what they could bear because some of my family members were also very busy... In order to avoid the changes of my work schedule cause too dramatic changes of their daily schedule, I hired a housekeeper to cook dinner for them” (H).*

*“My parents-in-law are very helpful...Like house chores and raising children, they are able to help me such housework. Therefore, it seems that all I am responsible is affairs outside home and I don’t need to worry anything inside home. There will be my family members to handle that. This is what I am blessed for. Otherwise, you know the workload of my bureau is very heavy” (G).*

*“It’s my mother-in-law to come to help us take care of our child, including sometimes I dress sloppily and she would make clothes for me. It says “One kitchen couldn’t contain two women.” In this part, I totally surrendered to my mother-in-law. My mother-in-law in my daughter’s childhood took my daughter to learn piano, to learn dance and participate in parents’ day...Until my father-in-law didn’t have good health as before, my daughter also felt unaccustomed because she had to take the trash out. Therefore, now we hire someone to do the cleaning” (E).*

*“My brother lives near by. Therefore, kids go to their uncle’s home before we come home. Moreover, I used to have a very good neighbor that helped us to pick up kids from school” (C).*

For the above female political appointees, they have someone else to take care of their house chores and help them in childrearing. As interviewee E said,

“This is a kind of division and diversity! In fact, if you have to play every role, it would be a candle burning from two ends.” Hsu (2002) interviewed female legislators in Taiwan. One interviewee even expressed that she was like a candle burning rather not from two ends but three because she had to play the role of daughter in-law, wife and mother. Conversely, our interviewees are much luckier because their family members could provide practical assistance and our interviewees have done some necessary adjustment, such as hiring a housekeeper.

As for interviewee K, D, and K, their husbands take more responsibilities in house chores and childcare. Take interviewee B for example. With the androgynous sex-role concept, she thought the stratification between man and woman is a product of artificial system and in the essence of nature there is no difference between man and woman, including courage and consideration. She said of her case,

*“I trained my husband from male chauvinist into a person who explored motherhood and took house chores for granted. Therefore, my husband does more house chores than I. Because he enjoyed in that and did a better job than I did, I just coped with him. In weekend he goes back to Taipei and does the house chores, and then returns to Tainan to work” (B).*

Actually, some children of our interviewees even take much responsibility of their house chores, such as interviewee C. Since her two daughters were young, she taught them the concept of sharing house chores and being independent. She said,

*“My children are very independent and they will even buy breakfast for us (Smiling). One is a junior of high school and the other is sixth grade of elementary school. They are very independent and self-reliance. My oldest child is responsible to set the alarm clock and ask her sister to wake up. Laundry is she to take care of. She only has five hundred dollars as her monthly pocket money. If sometimes my husband and I can’t make it, she will buy a rice-box for her sister” (C).*

Interviewee C also shared a meaningful and concept-breakthrough conversation with us. She thought we didn’t need to ask ourselves to be that perfect and house chores should be a matter of all family members. Her husband said, “I helped you doing the house chores.” She replied, “Why did all

house chores belong to me? All house chores are for you, and I help you do it.”

For some female political appointees, they are very lucky to have their relatives to help them in house chores and childcare. Some female political appointees' husbands were delighted to share with the house chores and childcare. Some female political appointees' children learned to be independent and take care of themselves or even their parents. However, one interviewee expressed that her husband didn't like to do the house chores and thought doing the house chore was a favor for his wife.

#### **4.1.5 Influences from Senior Politicians**

Female political appointees were influenced by their senior politicians. At eighteen, Interviewee L was still a college student. However, her part-time job and her boss with an unusual political background at that time changed her whole life. She recalled,

*“At the beginning, I did this assistant job as a temporary help, which led me into a completely different world because Kuo Yu-hsien was supervised by Information Office 24 hours a day. When I found this, I felt I fell into the thunderstone... The people and things I saw there was totally different from my life experiences. Then I realized that Taiwan society had what we called “political criminals”. For a youth in her twentieth, this seemed to be a big shock. But I think if you have basic sense of justice, you will have doubts about this (surveillance). Gradually, I have paid more attention to this. Mr. Kuo didn't mind letting me hear his conversation with other Tangwai politicians or political criminals. While I was sorting letters and documents, I was also listening to their conversations. I think those have a great influence on me. Because of this affinity, I participated in politics in my youth” (L).*

Since then, interviewee L has been very active in Tangwai movement and human rights movement, and eventually served the executive director of Taiwan's most prominent and human rights organization. The influence of Mr. Kuo was unexpectedly enormous for her. Because of interviewee L, interviewee K met the young, middle-aged, and old aged generation of Tangwai members. They strived together for political democracy and educational reform.

Interviewees F, E and B have participated in women's associations and movement for a long time. For them, working for women's right also

developed a great influence for them in their political socialization. Because of women's movement, they found many injustices in our society and further became more actively to participate in public affairs in order to adjust gender stereotypes and inequality of our society. They did researches, wrote papers, went demonstrations, and even got caught by police. They cherished the companionship and friendship of their members in women's associations and they wanted to carry out their ideals of gender equality into realization by their posts and administrative resources.

#### **4.1.6 Important Social Incidents**

In Taiwan's history, the Kaohsiung incident of 1979, the lift of martial law of 1987, and streets demonstration in 1990s, and Tiannanmen Square protests of 1989 in mainland China provoked initial political and public affairs' interests of some interviewees.

##### **a. The Kaohsiung Incident of 1979**

For interviewee N, the Kaohsiung incident and the Lin's family murders triggered her concerns for Taiwan politics and later she joined with the reform of the defendants after she returned from the United States.

*"The reason I started to take interests in politics in politics is because the Kaohsiung incident happened in my college years. Before long the Lin's family murders happened- Lin Yi-hsiung's mother and twin 7 year old girls were murdered. Our professor would talk about his opinion with us in our class" (N).*

The Kaohsiung incident<sup>5</sup> and the Lin's family murders galvanized interviewee N into later political action. It erupted following the police raid of Formosa Magazine, an illegal publication designed to support the end of KMT monopolization of power in Taiwan. The event would be a major turning point in Taiwan. The incident publicized the oppressive tactics of the KMT regime in ruling Taiwan and the trial of eight leaders of the protest allowed a team of lawyers to publicly question the practice of torture used by the KMT to extract confessions. (Natiomaster, 2004). Interviewee L was among the accused and stayed in prison until 1986. Interviewee K's husband was also caught in that incident and they got married after his release. After completion of their prison

---

<sup>5</sup> The Kaohsiung incident was the result of pro-democracy demonstrations that occurred in Kaohsiung to commemorate Human Rights Day on December 10, 1979.

terms, they participated in elections and continued their efforts for democracy in Taiwan. Interviewee L co-found DPP with other Tangwai members in September 28, 1986 and interviewee N and K also joined the New Tide faction of DPP.

### **b. The Lift of Martial Law & Other Democratic Movement**

As a journalist, interviewee G was influenced by the result of the liberalizing trend that began in the 1980s under President Chiang Ching-kuo. In 1987, he lifted the emergency decree, which had been in place since 1948 and which had granted unlimited powers to the president for use in the anti-communist campaign. She recalled,

*“I worked for the press since December 1987... Media ecology changed greatly because in 1988 most restrictions on the press had ended. I had a profound impression that President Chiang Ching-kuo passed away in 1988 and I was responsible to report this news. Later I had more chances to contact those affairs and gradually became more attentive to these developments of politics or public affairs” (G)*

The above words reflect that interviewee G had more opportunities to report political news since the government ended martial law and most restrictions on the press. With a more democratic political environment, interviewee G developed her own interests in politics through her journalist work and was more able to participate in those public affairs as she mentioned. But as a journalist, she had to have a neutral and objective stance in reporting. Hence, she didn't participate in politics or election directly. The reason she was willing to serve as a political appointment was because the 1993 magistrate election<sup>6</sup> in her county gave her a very great shock.

In 1993 election, interviewee G felt that she should be more than an outsider but someone who participated in that. She said,

*“In that time, I thought politics or public affairs need everybody's participation.*

---

<sup>6</sup> Su Chen-chang actively promoted “effective county government,” and was highly rated for his political achievements and successes. In 1993, while seeking reelection, Su Chen-chang's name was blackened by KMT candidate Wu Tzer-yuan, who accused him of hiking land prices in the “Pingtung Parks Case.” This piece of election slander hit Su hard, and ended up costing him the election (Hoile, 2002).



*When the magistrate invited me to such post, I hoped to perform out what I had understood and what I had expected in my journalist work. Therefore, I took up this post” (G).*

Taiwan had been through dramatic street demonstration in 1990s. The 520 street movement had been debated in interviewee C’s university class. Although she was not that clear about democratic movement, she could still experience the atmosphere of the democratic movement and later the Tianamen square protests.

## **4.2 Influence of Political Systems**

### **4.2.1 Electoral Systems**

In Taiwan, women compose 46% of the paid labor force and 50.3% of higher education (Bureau of Statistics, 2002). However, female representation of political appointees in Taiwan remains less than 10%.

During our interview, thirteen interviewees considered thirty percent or forty percent gender quotas at all political levels would enable women to break barriers and ensure women’s access to power structure. Some of them regarded this quota as temporary means of correcting imbalance and emphasizing giving capable women chance to prove their abilities. However, three interviewees worried the side-effects of this affirmative action because they valued personal capabilities more than gender itself. Proponent opinions listed bellow:

*“Yes! Nordic gender quota is enacted in their parties’ regulations, because the elections there use party as a unit. ...The election system in Taiwan is mixed. We have representatives who were elected by people directly and we also have seats allotting by party’s votes. Additionally, the central election and local one are separated. Thus, we could not follow the Nordic party’s gender nomination quota. The best way, besides the regulation of the number of female nomination with party’s regulations and changes of election rules, is to amend the constitution to enact that the gender quota is no less than 30% or 40% of every election. This is the fastest way” (H).*

Interviewee B pointed out that a 50/50 policy in UN, but she also mentioned the difficulty to carry that out in the current political and cultural environment.

*“Absolutely! In United Nations the gender ration is 1:1; however, it is not possible to*

*apply in our domestic laws because the power of politics is controlled in men's hands. Take the structure of Legislative Yuan as an instance. DPP takes care of women but so far it could only propose the figure of 1/4. Moreover, in fact, women are against women. In the early period of women emancipation in Europe, the biggest enemy was women themselves because they didn't have confidence to hand over power into the hands of women. I think our culture so far is not progressive enough to elect a female president or a female mayor in Kaohsiung city. I think the culture of Taiwan is still hesitating, thus it's difficult to put it into laws" (B).*

Like interviewee L, Interviewee K also agreed with a 50/50 policy to let women have the right to speak for them.

*"We decided long time ago that women compose half of the population, they must have 1/2 rights to speak in the government decision-making, and to allot nation's resources in the most suitable places for women, for family, and for our society" (K).*

She argued female politicians viewed the role of a nation and the role of a government from women's perspectives and they were more likely to take care of women's interests. She threw out a question "Does any male politician care about the issues women concerned?" Hsu (2002) studied the political participation of the 4<sup>th</sup> female legislators and concluded female legislators were more likely to bring women's issues into political agenda (the percent of women who proposed laws for women ranged from 85% to 100%). Obviously, the representation of women in politics is important for women. Interviewee K also hoped to build role models of female politicians through the process of affirmative actions.

Interviewees H, O, E regarded that the low participation of women in politics results from that our government and society which did not encourage women to participate in public affairs in the past. In order to correct the social values towards women, they supported affirmative actions before striking a balance of gender equality in politics as a temporary means.

*"I think it is just a transitional means before the gender equality is realized... Like Taipei city councilors, the problem of female reserved seat does not exist. Because the votes which women got are much more than men, they did not need reserved seats. Therefore, when you process to that level, you do not even need these temporary means" (H).*

However, they also emphasized that women should not rely on such affirmative actions and in the long run women should compete with men with the same conditions. As for interviewee P, she noticed that the social structure of our current society and the advancement of technology have led the competition differences between men and women gradually debilitating.

*“In fact, in many work fields, the advantages of women are much higher than men. Therefore, I think with the protection of laws and the policy supports from parties are good. Women themselves have to be self-conscious that they have to compete with men on the same basis and not to depend on special protections of laws. Those laws and policies are correcting the concept of the general that women are more disadvantaged. Then party regulations and rules of laws could only correct those concepts. This has positive help for women, but when individual woman participation in the work field or public affairs, she still needs to expect herself to compete with others at the same basis” (P).*

Besides to correct the social values towards women, as the directors in the South countries of Taiwan, Interviewee C and G, both a mother of two, regarded this affirmative action could help women to break the glass ceiling existing in higher-ranking executive positions because in southern Taiwan, they found it would not possible for women to have so much time to build a network as men do because women tended to take care of their family and their children. As interviewee G who was troubled by the male culture of drinking and social activities expressed:

*“I think this would help a lot. Actually, this is obvious. After DPP had such rule, no matter at that time this was a means or not- she might represent her husband or her father, but after all after she entered into political arena, she is an independent individual and she can develop her style of political participation and her way to concern public affairs. Thus I think this quota will help women to participate in politics.*

*Second, I feel that women are less likely to summon friends and fellows together or to form a clique. Maybe it's due to nature inclination; women will still take care of family. Therefore, I think if when she participates in politics with such quota, it would motivate her to participate more. ...Further, if we have such regulation, it would encourage a family to develop her abilities instead of putting all expectations on*

*men. ...The number of male competitors are more than female, thus if the qualifications of that female is good enough, it would be faster for women to have outstanding performance under cultivations than men” (G).*

Although most of female political appointees interviewed have positive thinking towards 30% to 40% gender quota, interviewee D, F, and J had different opinions. Some political affirmative action has the best potential to compensate for the non-consciously sexist practices. However, even among people who are in strongly favor of gender or race equality, affirmative action is highly contentious because it seems, to many people specifically to violate the very principle of equal opportunity and is unconcerned about basic democratic principles of meritocracy (Sapiro, 2003). Interviewee J expressed the same thought.

*“The gender quota probably exists in North Europe. Neither country of Western Europe has such regulation. I think only a few countries have that rule. In my professional area or the work I have, I never felt that because I am a female thus I have special treatment. I think that women themselves have to be very capable. Secondly, is it necessary to enact a law? Like President Chen, he has such concept, which doesn’t come from law. I think the performance of women is also very important. I think women have her characteristics and men have his characteristics. The most important thing is whether she can manage that job” (J).*

Interviewee F thought that gender quota in broad scope maybe work, but when it was put into action, it easily caused some inappropriate side-effects. For example, some outstanding feminists were excluded from women’s awakening committee because of the gender quota and men who were not that familiar with women’s issues were included in this committee to discuss women’s interests. Secondly, sometimes it’s hard to find a woman in Bureau of Engineering. Lastly, some actions are easily to become just a form without truly gender-equality consciousness. Interviewee D added that the importance of gender consciousness of every executive in government. She said,

*“I don’t think women quota will definitely raise women’s status or increase policies related with women. If she is a political appointee or a minister; however, she doesn’t have gender consciousness, it still doesn’t work.... I think, it is more important that as every minister of every department, would he or she be willing to considerate this issue...” (D).*

### 4.2.2 Contests among Political Parties

Escobar-Lemmon and Taylor-Robinson (2004) found that partisan competition advantaged women. For instance, interviewee O said,

*“That female becomes political appointee is a political issue since Chen Shui-bian served as Taipei mayor. The ratio of female political appointees then became a habit. People started to concern that whether governors would promote female political appointees or not. I guess this could be luck and also a possibility that because I am female, with engineering background, I got appointed. This could also be one possibility” (O).*

In 1996, DPP passed one-fourth gender principle in party list and nominated Annette Lu as its vice president candidate in 2000. After the election, President Chen Shui-bian fulfilled his campaign promise to adopt 1/4 gender quota. This led the ratio of female ministers in Taiwan increasing from 15.6% to 25.7%, which ranked tenth in the world. Moreover, ministries that have high levels of power, prestige and significant financial resources were headed by women. Those ministries included Interior, Transportation and Communications, and Mainland Affairs. Those appointments even broke tokenism, and media were drawn to report those female ministers.

In 2000, KMT, the past long-ruling party in Taiwan not only elected the first female vice party leader, but elected more than 1/3 women as members of central executive commission. It also stipulated that women should compose at least 1/4 of every commission members. Furthermore, it modified its nomination for nationwide non-district female legislators to adopt one-fourth women quota. Party contestation advantages the appointment of women. Our interviewees expressed:

*“In order to change the structure of women’s political participation, to let DPP, because we thought this party should be friendly to the youth and women, have a bright future, we need to have women’s and the youth’s support. Thus we have always claimed that DPP is a more hopeful party in Taiwan, which could take care of women’s rights in every aspect, no matter in women’s development, in human security or in country’s care system.*

*In the past, women in politics were inclined to family. In the times of anti-KMT movement, many were represented their fathers or their husband. If women felt that*

*they want to participate in politics by themselves, frankly speaking, the number was so few! Most of them needed to have family background or other special reasons. But then we decided to start from positions within party. At that time we sought to implement 1/4 gender quota of party positions. Because DPP carried out 1/4 gender quota of party positions, it composed pressure to KMT. In terms of women's issues, there is always one force which is beyond parties and above parties. Women would say DPP can do this. The same this would be a pressure for KMT that the insiders of KMT started to discuss this issue and that women asked it to implement 1/4 gender quota of its party positions. Yeah, KMT talked about 1/4 quota often, but its party support for quota laws is more rhetoric than reality..." (K).*

*"Honestly speaking, comparing with other parties, DPP governments, no matter the central or the local, gives women more spheres in politics. The first female director of Pingtung county was appointed in the term of Magistrate Shi-Jia Chyuan. She is our current secretary and at that time she was director of Land Administration" (G).*

*"When Miss Peng Wan-roo was the director of DPP women's department, she proposed that 1/4 gender quota. This article was passed in DPP's meeting....Later, when Chen Shui-bian served as Taipei mayor, he had 1/4 women in his cabinet. After he got elected as president, our cabinet maintained around 1/4 women ministers" (L).*

Their saying reflected that as party competition becomes fiercer in Taiwan, the ratio of female political appointees has become an issue that political parties were more aware of.

## **4.3 Other Factors**

### **4.3.1 Socio-Cultural Factors**

Ideas about women's role and position in society can enhance or constrain women's ability to seek political power. Thus, despite the presence of favorable political systems or an adequate supply of qualified female candidates, cultural norms can limit women's opportunities to participate in politics (Rule & Zimmerman, 1994). This research interviewed sixteen female political appointees. We find that some mothers of our interviewees opposed their daughters to step into politics. Furthermore, the very division between public/private and man/woman composes the different expectations on male

and female political appointees, such as house chores, caring and even their abilities in dealing with politics.

### **a. Women against Women**

Similar to Hsu's (2002) result, we found that "mother" is often the one against their daughters to run elections or to participate in politics. This reflects that the family is a site of inequality where people tend to internalize male and female attitudes and transmit them to their own children, which perpetuates male domination and female subordination as suggested by feminists. In our interviews, there are two kinds of "women against women" phenomenon-disagreement and contradictory feelings between proponents and opponents.

#### **(1) The First Type: Disagreement**

As interviewee P talked about her mother's opinion regarding her position, she said,

*"My mother possessed more traditional concepts. She thought women should not conduct in too rigid jobs, especially serving in government organizations. Moreover, the task of my Commission is more political oriented; therefore, she still felt this didn't belong to the types of work that women should do" (P).*

#### **(2) The Second Type: Contradictory Feelings**

Interviewee C revealed that her mother didn't like her to serve as political appointee while felt quite proud of her. Conversely, her father encouraged her to do her best on this political position and would offer her needed support. She expressed,

*"When I came to county government, my mother kept mentioning that "Why did you come that far to work? Being close to home and doing a good job at teaching are enough. Taking good care of children is enough. Conversely, my father said "If you want to do, do it well. Do you need any help, such as taking children to school?" (C).*

In the first type, interviewee P's mother did not support her to serve as political appointees because her mother regarded that politics belonged to men and wanted to protect her from the political arena. In the second type, Interviewee C's mother regards teaching and child-caring composed the most

priorities. Their mothers had internalized patriarchal values and sex-discriminated labor division. Therefore, this derives into the “women against women” phenomena that our interviewees had faced.

### **b. The Distrust of Women’s Ability**

Many female political appointees noted that the performance and efforts of women were not easy to get recognition.

*“If women want to get promoted and to be able to stand in such positions, in fact, she has to devote much more than others...” (O).*

*“Of course women have to strive harder than others in every field. This is for sure because people are not easier to observe your performance. Women are more modest...” (H).*

*“In fact, I think women in politics pay a lot. It takes double efforts to get others’ recognition. Generally speaking, it is less easy for female ministers to get recognition. For instance, in many cases, the core decision team is almost without any female, no matter from the central (government) to the local or from the local to the central. If you have better performance and act tough, people would say “you are not cute.” Didn’t you (the general public) want us to prove our ability? For instance, Chen Wen-chen is very smart but she had received denigration from others” (I).*

Interviewee C, a senior high-school teacher and a previous director of Teacher Association, got appointed in her thirties. She talked about her bad feeling at the beginning:

*“When I came to this post, people chatted about it! They thought I took advantage of something as a stepping stone...Many people asked me “Would it cost you a lot to be a director?” “Not even a penny! Would you think that our magistrate is very cute?” I replied. This is my personal experience! But some people just thought that way. They felt this is a practical world!” (C).*

The feelings and experiences of our interviewees reflect that women are discriminated in politics. Studies (Norris, 1985; Paxton & Kunovich, 2003; UN, 1992) showed that women were discriminated against by voters and by the political elite merely because of their sex. Voters tended to perceive women as less qualified than men to hold public office and as single-issue candidates who are concerned only with women’s issues (Park, 1999). Attitude surveys by Darcy, Welch, and Clark (1994) in the U.S. and Paxton and Kunovich (2003)



indicated the concept that most men were better suited for politics than women still existed and composed a strong negative impact on women's representation in national legislatures.

Ideas about women's role and position in society can constrain women's ability to seek political power. Public opinion has been shown to matter for a variety of political outcomes (Burstein, 1998). Discriminatory attitudes can cause uncomfortable experiences for women who actively participate in politics. Interviewee K, with a master degree in politics and a husband with active political background, shared her experiences serving at different political positions.

*"I became a non-district legislator in 1996 and my husband often came to my office and we did things together. Later on I came to the Administration Department. In fact both of us are very scrupulous. He would not come to participate in anything. Otherwise, it would receive a lot of unreasonable criticism from others. It is very interesting. We are friends and we have the same life experiences; our vision is the same. We both know clearly the restrictions of political participation. He leads a happy life now and I do my own stuff. If anyone talks to him about education, he will just say that he doesn't take care of this business. If he takes charge of anything, people will say "he comes to here to take charge of things." This will cause troubles, especially for female leaders. This is the gender problem that I want to talk to you. The husband of female leader, if people think through him, they can do what and what, it will have serious rumors outside the department. The distinction is very complicated; therefore, it is not convenient for him to come to my department" (K).*

Under the Chinese tradition that "Man for the field and woman for the hearth" women tend to be categorized into private sphere, while men tend to be categorized into public sphere. Such tradition leads to the stereotype that women can't have individual thinking and judgment and women have to reply on men to make decision or women let men to dominate the decision. Therefore when interviewee K's husband went to her department, people thought her husband might interfere into the affairs within her department. However, as interviewee K discovered that

*"if the Minister is male, deputy minister is male, if his wife comes; everybody feels it's all right. If the husband (of female Minister) comes, what would you think about it? This is very strange and impalpable. Because we often hear many female elected mayors that her husband interfered too much and involved too much. Women often discuss something with her spouse, but he can't involve into the whole system. We*

*follow this restriction strictly. When I just came here, there was much blackmail..”*  
(K).

Women in Taiwan in the past didn’t participate in high-level politics. Thus people contain sex-role stereotype that they can’t believe that women have individual thinking and governing ability. Interviewee K has had profound interests in politics since college and participated in Dang-wai movement. She studied in Institute of Politics later on. Her knowledge and experiences in politics are no less than her husband’s. But due to the stereotype of the tradition private/public division, people tended to distrust her individual ability at the beginning.

### 4.3.2 Social economical factors

#### a. Education

Many political scientists see the persistence of women’s lack of political power as a predictable outcome of the ways in which advantages are distributed in society. Structural barriers refer to educational level, professional experience and levels of income (UN, 1992).

When our female political appointees, who were born in 1940s and 1950s, received their university education, indeed there were not very many women in universities. Table 4.2. shows there were 11,877 female college students in 1966 compared with 25,049 men. Women at that time didn’t have equal chance as men to receive higher education.

Table 4.2. Gender Ratio of College Students in Taiwan, 1966-2001

	Total number of Male	Total number of female	Ratio of male (%)	Ratio of female (%)
1966	25,049	11,877	67.7	32.1
1976	69,375	41,625	62.5	37.5
1986	108,672	83,328	56.6	43.4
1996	199,251	193,749	50.7	49.3
2001	296,682	294,318	50.2	49.8

Note. Gender Statistics (2002). Retrived December 1, 2003, from <http://www.dgbas.gov.tw/public/Data/411711334571.pdf> ,p. 32.

Female political appointees in this research tend to be drawn from a small number of occupational groups, such as lawyers, professors and journalists, with at least a university education: five of them with doctoral degree, seven Master, and four Bachelor in subjects ranging from laws, and piano & orchestra, to philosophy, public affairs management, politics, sociology, urban development, foreign languages and literatures, journalists and education. These educational backgrounds help them to work as professionals and further nurture their ability to participate in politics. For some female political appointees, they regarded their higher education opportunities as a gift from their parents which helped them break the social-structure barriers and participate in politics:

*“My father is a labor worker. I am a child of labor classes. My mother is aboriginal. We lived in a simple environment in that economic condition of the times. They didn’t talk to me with high morals, but expected me to study. My father said to me, “As long as you want to study, I will manage to afford you.” The scene when my father counted the money to me etched into my mind. I still remember his dark hands. I felt very sad at that night. My father had worked so hard for me to continue my studies” (G).*

*“I came from a family with little education. My family was very poor and my siblings didn’t receive much education....But if I have chance to study, my father would never say, “You can’t go to school.” My young brother didn’t study as much as I. That is because of personal difference, but not of sexes” (E).*

*“I think women of my grandfather’s generation almost are illiterate. Because I am not an obedient kid, when I saw my cousins to study, it had some influence on me. Then when I wanted to go to college, at that time Taiwan’s agricultural village had started to decline. Actually, we had gone through a hard time, but my parents supported my choice and expected me to be a teacher...” (L).*

Education and economic independence would enable women to break free from their subordinate position and to obtain their political resources. Most female political leaders have had a college or university education, which could enable them to break through structural gender-specific roles, such as men/women, public/private, reason/emotion, and to enter the political arena successfully. For instance, Vigdis Finnbogadóttir was a teacher. Charles was a lawyer and Thatcher trained as a chemist and subsequently studied law, having spent some time in scientific research prior to entering politics.

Aquino, Bhutto and Chamorro studied in the United States (UN, 1992). This is consistent with our research finding:

*“The low number of women in high-ranking administrative positions results from the absence of experiences, low education, and labor division of house chore. In most societies of the past, there were not many opportunities for women. Therefore, the number of highly-educated women is small, and the number of women in the labor force is small, and women usually have low achievement or work in the factory or in underground economy. In a word, this social background is common in Taiwan as elsewhere” (E).*

*“At that time, people usually have a lot of siblings! Many parents would tell their daughter to work and afford their family livings as soon as she had graduate from senior-high” (G).*

Studying in a democratic country can stimulate people living in a different political system to have some inspiration. Although both of interviewee N and F didn't graduate from the department of laws or politics, after they studied in the United States, the political system and feminism there caused them to rethink what happened in Taiwan and turned into their perseverance and actions of social reforms.

*“When I went abroad to study, I saw the democratic system was so mature and advanced and I felt the huge gap between Taiwan and the United States. I thought Taiwan lacked of ideal political reforms to carry out freedom, equality and democracy. Therefore, I joined in prevailing democratic movement at that time as soon as returning to Taiwan” (N).*

*“When I went to the United States to study at graduate school, I read feminist books. Because of women's movement, I became more interested in public affairs” (F).*

## **b. Occupation Status**

Norris (1985) points out a significant connection between female political recruitment and patterns of employment. Lawyers, journalists, academics, teachers and businessmen are statistically over-represented in parliaments. These occupational backgrounds provide expertise and confidence in public speaking, a knowledge of government and familiarity with the law, as well as considerable flexibility in combining a long-term professional career with the

demands and uncertainties of public office, which is consistent with our finding.

Table 4.3. Major Employment Pattern of Female Political Appointees

Job/Party	DPP	Non-partisan
Legislator	M, K, N	
Professor	J, B, A	P, F
Civic Official	O	H, D
Journalist	K, L	G, I
Lawyer		E
Teacher		C

Table 4.3. suggests a significant connection between female political appointment and patterns of employment. Female political appointees are drawn from legislators, academics, teachers, lawyers and journalists. Legislators and professors are most likely to be appointed.

### (1) Legislative Experiences

Interviewee M, K, N all had legislative experiences. Interviewee M, last legislator for ten years, was famous for eliminating “black-money” politics and construction bribe as well as provoking minority concerns at her term. She expressed that she understood the political arena in legislative Yuan in Taiwan because of her previous career background. As a minister since the first political transition in 2000, she handled the pressure from the legislator with the following thinking:

*“Of course, the suggestions of legislators, as long as it could really benefit our people, we would adopt them. However, if the suggestion of legislators did not represent all members of our country or if it harms other people’s benefit, no matter how much pressure I would have to face, I would not adopt this suggestion. My priorities is peoples’ interests first, then party’s interests, group’s interests and lastly individual interests.” (M)*

Appointee K was a non-district legislator before she entered the Ministry of Education in 2000. She was enthusiastic about educational reforms since ten years ago. She even went to educational demonstration with her kid and her other family members. She has many friends who continuously participated in social reform activities. After she entered legislative Yuan, she chose to participate in Education Commission. Although DPP was a minority party at

that time, she managed to combine other party's support and passed many important educational laws in Taiwan. She expressed:

*“Because my assistants were very hard-working, as a result, if people have education problems, they came to us. We became much busier, because everyone came to us. After Chen Shui-bian was elected, he asked Dean Lee Yuan Tseh to provide some candidates in education. At that time, some educational reform groups discussed with Dr. Lee. After that, Dr. Lee wanted me to enter the Ministry of Education because I have the legislative experiences. Those experiences would be helpful to deal with Legislative Yuan, to propel law enactment, and to assist the Minister. I represent the ruling party. To be appointed is not in my plan; otherwise, I would still work as a non-district legislator. I was only in the half of my second term” (K)*

The same as interviewee K, N was also a non-district legislator before she got appointed as the General Secretary of the Executive Yuan. Her appointment was based on her abundant administrative experiences such as secretary of county government, director of Environmental Protection Administration (EPA), vice magistrate of Taichuang county.

## **(2) Previous Cabinet Member**

As for interviewee L, this is her third appointment. Interviewee L, who used to serve from the Taipei Bureau of Social Affairs to take up the equivalent position in the Kaohsiung city, has long battled on behalf of disadvantaged groups in society. She expressed how she got appointed as follows.

*“To be appointed is because when President Chen Shui-bian was Taipei mayor, I served at his cabinet. However, he was not re-elected. Then I went to Kaohsiung city as Director of Social Affairs. ...I know Chen was preparing his presidential election in 2000, therefore I lobbied for him during my days at Kaohsiung. After Chen was elected, because I was in his cabinet team, he hoped I accept to take responsibilities of the Council of Labor Affairs. I think labor issues are related with my previous job for human rights. But I do have some pressure to serve as the chairwoman of the Council of Labor Affairs. No matter what you do, facing 7.8 million labors in Taiwan, you would be criticized. The president kept telling me, “Sure, this is a tough task and a big challenge.” He thought this is what I should work hard. I don't think I have other choice. They thought labors and disadvantaged groups are related with my faith of human rights. I certainly know this is not a favorable job. But a person can not favor others in her life time. Do what is correct, and do what I should do” (L).*

### **(3) Senior Civil Servant**

Interviewee H, a senior civil servant for 21 years with a respectable law professor as her husband, expressed that

*“I spent 11 years at Commission of Legal Affairs in the Executive Yuan. I was too familiar with affairs in Commission of Legal Affairs.... Actually, I felt my job at that time did not provide much challenge. Then someone in Ministry of Justice persuaded me to receive this current job as a support of former minister, Mayor Ma....I felt this is a new challenge, so I had made strong determination to quit my job. Because a civil servant has to work at least 25 years before her retirement, I did make such a determination....” (H).*

For her, to be appointed was a surprise in her life. But looking for new challenges and having some expectation of the new administrative appealing system that she herself participated the revision of the appealing law at Legal Affairs Commission in the Executive Yuan plus Mayor Ma who was a nice supervisor in her eyes, she jumped into this field. As for another interviewee O with civil servant experiences, she was very grateful that someone valued her. Although she had to face uncertainties after appointment, she expressed that *“as a chairperson, she has the right to correct some bad things. As a chairperson, she has the chance to put what she had learned in the textbook into practice, into reality.”* Thus for her ambition and her dream, she also quitted her original steady job.

### **(4) Journalist**

As a senior journalist in Pingtung county, interviewee G expressed, *“I had much more contact with the public while I worked for the newspaper. I have basic understanding of governmental affairs and the general public. Thus, the Magistrate asked me to serve in such position, although I don’t graduate from the department of social workers. He thought I could get familiar and involved pretty soon, thus he asked me to serve as Director of Social Affairs.”*

### **(5) Lawyer**

Interviewee E was a lawyer for more than twenty years and actively participated in women’s organizations. Prior to that, she was a public prosecutor of Hsin-chu district court for ten years. Mayor Shie was also a lawyer and had certain trust on her performance. In the third year of Mayor Shie’s first term, women’s groups recommended E to Mayor Shie invite her to serve at the current post. Someone asked her whether she made less money

after appointed, she expressed “as a lawyer, you are a “symbol of justice.” But if you are a director of Legal Affairs Bureau, you can help other administrative department develop their regulations. Those regulations contain numerous principle of equality and their impacts would last...” This is the reason that she abandoned her handsome-paid job and transferred into the governmental post.

After the discovery of those female political appointees’ growing background, their personal affiliations in Taiwan’s social context, one thing is certain-the expertise of our interviewees in their particular fields and their prior working experience had been important factors in their appointment selection. Secondly, their formal education, professional experience and personal ideologies had enabled them to escape many of conventional myths or stereotypes that so often limit a woman’s role in society (UN, 1992). Lastly, their passion to serve, to improve our society is a driving force for them to take their appointment.

#### 4.4 Female Political Research Results Comparison

Qualitative researches in Taiwan aimed at exploring female political participation experiences, such as county councilors, officials of Democratic Progressive Party, assistants of legislators, and village directors (Peng, 1998).

In order to have an abundant picture of female political participation, this following section contrasts with the research “Critical influencing factors in women’s political participation in Taiwan: a study on the 4th female legislators” of Hsu in 2002. Such comparison will effectively gain more full explanations of Taiwan female political participation in different spectrum.

**Table 4.4. Research Results Comparison between Our Research and Hsu’**

	Hsu (2002)	Our Research (2004)
Interviewee’s average age	44	Central:46 <sup>a</sup> Local:44
Education background	Doctoral & Master 24% Bachelor 67% Senior high and below 9%	Doctoral & Master 69% Bachelor 31%
Political party	KMT 52% DPP 33% People First Party 10% New Party 5%	DPP 50% <sup>c</sup> Non-partisan 50%

(table continues)



**Table 4.4. (continued)**

	Hsu (2002)	Our Research (2004)
Previous profession	Educator 29% Legislator 24% Journalist 19%	Educator 38% Political appointee 31% Legislator 25% Journalist 25% Administrator 25% Lawyer/Attorney 6% Political Researcher 6% Government Advisor 6%
Family background	Political family 43% Non-political family 43% Husband in politics 24%	Non-political family 94% Political family 6% Husband in politics 19%
Political socialization process	1.Social activities as a student 5% 2.Abroad Study 14% 3.Social movement activist 29% 4.Campaign assistant 19% 5.Marriage 19%	1.Campaign assistant 56% 2.Social movement activist 56% 3.Work 38% 4.Education 31% 5.Marriage 19% 6.Abroad study 13% 7.Social activities as a student 13% 8.Abroad Study 13%
Personal motive	1.Party recruitment 43% 2.Encouragement from family, friends and local residents 62% 3.Personal will 19%	1.President/Prime Minister/Mayor recruitment 100% 2.Personal will 100% 3.Encouragement from family and friends 88% 4.Introduced by somebody 25% 5.Introduced by women's organization 6%

<sup>a</sup> 46 is the average age of 8 central appointees in 2000.

Political elites are pulled disproportionately from the highly educated and from certain professions, such as lawyer, university professors and journalists (Putnam, 1976). Hsu's research demonstrated the significant correlation between female political recruitment and patterns of employment. Lawyers, journalists, academics, teachers were statistically over-represented in parliaments.

*“It provides chances for woman in parliaments to build her capabilities. Because the multi-decisions culture in the parliament, she has more opening space to learn. But in executive branch, if you do not have enough expertise, the quality of city policies would meet challenges and questions.” (E)*

Female political appointees in this research tend to be drawn from a small number of occupational groups, which is similar to Hus’ results. Notably, the political experiences in legislature may help women climb the ladder to public office. In fact, female political appointees are much older and better-educated than female legislators. This reflects that women of top-ranking executive positions arrived with outstanding qualifications and administrative experiences. Most interviewees in this research expressed that their capabilities were highly-valued by their appointers or someone close to their appointers. Their appointers relied on our interviewees’ expertise and capabilities to implement and advocate public policies; while some representatives of the Legislative Yuan or local councils also depended on our interviewees to provide professional advices for them.

Institutional differences in political systems may manifest a different “demand” for women, irrespective of the available supply. The party system is the power base of political life. As for representative, in 1996, DPP passed one-fourth gender principle in party list. In 1999, KMT also modified its nomination for nationwide non-district female legislators to adopt one-fourth women quota. But as for political appointee, there is no such provision among no matter DPP or KMT. During our interview, 13 interviewees considered 30 percent or 40 percent gender quotas at all political levels will enable women to break barriers and ensure women’s access to power structure. Some of them regarded this quota as temporary means of correcting imbalance and emphasizing giving capable women chance to proof their abilities. However, three interviewees worried the side-effects of this affirmative action. They concerned personal capabilities more than gender itself.

Our interviewees expressed different diverse reasons of how they became interested in public affairs and politics. Comparison with Hsu (2002), women ministers showed more activism, which allows them from movement to government. While other female political appointees tended to be familiar with public affairs and politics through their working experiences. As political participation should not be seen as restricted to participation in parties or

representative bodies, off their work, many of our interviewees are actively involved in community action groups, in issue groups, such as interviewee F, E, D and A in women's organizations and interviewee C in teacher's union. Those activities provide opening for capabilities building with opportunities for increasing women's political participation. Our interviewees expressed that they built knowledge about how the government runs, developed their leadership, and also their political network and reputation. But most importantly, they created their political opportunities through their long-term devotion to public affairs.

Hsu (2002) found that most of the fourth female legislators in Taiwan who participated in legislator's election for the first time were inclined to dependent on their political family background or have political spouses. Different from Hsu (2002)'s finding, most of our interviewees have no outstanding political family background nor do married interviewees have a political spouse, except four of the married, which reflects the independence and political competence our interviewees possess.

Hsu (2002) found that family support in house chores and childcare was essential for female legislators, which is consistent with our findings. In our investigation, we found that our interviewees with young children to take care of either have relatives to help them in child caring or hire a nanny to do the house chores, which implies it is hard for women themselves to strike a balance between motherhood and political participation without others' help; meanwhile, this also reflects that the positions of appointment take much time and energy to devote to.

## Chapter 5 Women in Politics

United Nations Development Programme (2000) stated women's presence in governance has changed the nature of the political agenda itself. Questions concerning reproductive health and choice, nutrition, equality in education and in employment opportunities and circumstances, child care and related 'family-friendly aspects, and environment are only a few the areas that women have either brought into public debate or highlighted with significant substantive victories at both national and international levels.

This chapter summarizes the difference our interviewees have made, the interactions with the Legislative Yuan, their local council, other departments or bureaus in their positions and the suggestions they provided as to increase women in politics as well as enhance women's contributions in politics.

### 5.1 Women Make a Difference

Although "difference" is debatable because it is frequently subjective, women at all socio-cultural and economic levels have experiences that differ from those of men and that are reflected in different approaches, needs, insights and, often, goals (UNDP, 2000). This research found many examples to support this assertion. In fact, among 16 interviewees, many of them pushed for policies related with women's rights and needs. For instance, interviewee L helped to pass "Gender Equality in Employment Law" on December 21, 2001. This law attempts to eliminate sex discrimination and sex harassment in the workplace. It also stipulates the provision of a menstruation leave or a maternity leave. Another example was that interviewee A noticed that past "gender-neutral" policy resulted in fewer female taking advantage of government loan; thus she started a female-friendly policy to offer women's loans and leadership classes; interviewee E, G, N tended to promote capable female subordinates in their divisions.

*"Last year we had chance to recruit one Section chief. There are two candidates with the same experiences and the same qualification. But we recruited women first" (E).*

*"Since I served as female political appointee, whenever we held meetings or community, I have always noticed if there is any female member on the broad list... I will ask them to find a capable and qualified woman in the broad. Moreover, if there*

*is a position vacancy, the male candidate and the female candidate have the same ability; I will promote woman first. I think women should not only serve at low-level civic task and all the superiors are men” (N).*

*“When I served as Director, I also had chances to recruit section chief. At that time, I recommended to Magistrate, “I think there is one candidate very suitable for this position. Many affairs in our County rely on her..Women seldom have chance to be promoted. Therefore, when the manager is willing to select this woman, this manager sees her having potential for further development” (G).*

Interviewee B describes her awareness of women’s needs: *“I used to speak for the design of our parks. In fact as a woman, parks have great connection to me. For instance, I took advantage of parks to let my six-month old baby to use baby stroller. This functionality is understood only by feministic view. But our parks almost have no such design. The gap of recognition between genders is very large. No man will understand such need. From my experience, my bureau didn’t know such needs. Moreover, I had provided one suggestion stemming from sex. We have many details in environmental designing. For instance, our pedestrian paths were built from feministic perspectives. This pedestrian path won’t let your high heels get stuck in the road”.*

Interviewee B’s experience showed that women make a difference. She acknowledged that this didn’t mean man couldn’t perform the same policy as woman, and she concludes *“This depends on whether you have enough percentage of women in your team to let your team have different thoughts; therefore it is necessary to have certain ratio of women in political appointment.”*

Besides substantial impacts that the above six female appointees had made, their presence instilled a fresh perception of politicians. Most interviewed female political appointees addressed several characteristics of female political appointees. The list of these characteristics included hard working, delicacy, perseverance, inclined to communication, and dislike of the distance of bureaucracy.

## **5.2 Appointive Factors**

According to our interviews, the reasons why they got appointed include: (1) recognition of their work performance and ability; (2) someone’s recommendation of their appointment; (3) previous experience in the

appointer's cabinet.

**(1) Recognition of their work performance and ability**

Examples of this kind include P, O, F, D, M, and N.

*“Before 2000 I had chances to participate in national security affairs. After 2000, President Chen talked to me. He thought I had international trade background. Because he hoped to have some achievement in cross-strait trade affairs, he invited me to serve in his cabinet” (P).*

*“It might be the recognition of my work performance. I had been promoted by my supervisors and then became a political appointee” (O).*

*“The Mayor thought I had a four-year experience in public sector; thus he invited me to serve as this post” (F).*

*“It was possible that most of the front work of Social Bureau were in charged by me. Because our previous director had transferred to serve as vice magistrate and our magistrate couldn't find other substitute in a short time, he then invited me to such post” (D).*

*“Because I am a national celebrity, the president hoped me to serve at this post. My past experience in commercial marketing can increase the visibility of my council” (M).*

*“Most DPP members had access to politics by elections but they lacked administrative experiences. Thus my administrative experiences are the main reason for me to serve at this post” (N).*

**(2) Someone's recommendation of their appointment**

Examples of this kind include K, I, E, and A.

*“After Chen Shui-bian was elected, he asked Dean Lee Yuan Tseh to provide some candidates in education. At that time, some educational reform groups discussed with Dr. Lee. After that, Dr. Lee wanted me to enter the Ministry of Education because I have the legislative experiences. Those experiences would be helpful to deal with Legislative Yuan, to propel law enactment, and to assist the Minister” (K).*

*“This post was available and someone recommended me; thus I served at this post” (I).*

*“Women’s groups recommended me to such post” (E).*

*“Lin Yi-hsiung recommended me to serve as this post” (A).*

### **(3) Previous experience in the appointer’s cabinet**

Examples of this kind include L.

*“To be appointed is because when President Chen Shui-bian was Taipei mayor, I served at his cabinet.” (L).*

## **5.3 Interactions with Parliaments and Other Departments**

Until today, very little research has systematically explored the careers and perspectives of these high-ranking female appointees in Taiwan. Female appointees are answerable to Parliament and are responsible for a particular Ministry. This research tried to explore the careers and perspectives of our interviewees by inquiring their interactions with parliament and other ministries/bureaus. This section summarized our interviews results into five kinds of interactions; (1) the interaction frequency between the ministry of the central female appointee and other ministries; (2) the role of the interactions with other ministries; (3) the interaction between the ministry of the central female appointee and the Legislative Yuan; (4) the interaction between the bureau of the local female appointee and other bureaus; (5) the interaction between the bureau of the local female appointee and the local council.

### **5.3.1 First Kind of Interactions**

From our interviews, we categorize the interaction frequency between the ministry of the central female appointee and other ministries into two types: (1) Few interactions, such as A; (2) Many interactions, such as J, L, and O.

#### **(1) Few interactions**

Examples of this kind include A.

*“We seldom cooperate with other departments. In the issue of women’s business start-up, because other departments have never done this before and my department initiated women’s entrepreneur programs. After we started such program, Small and Medium Business Administration of Ministry of Economic Affairs would invite us to hold some conferences and meetings. After we started women’s business start-up loans program, we held some conferences about related issues of women’s business*

*start-up programs of APEC. Because Ministry of Foreign Affairs is responsible for the affairs with APEC, we had a lot of interactions with Ministry of Foreign Affairs when holding these conferences. It is a fact that every department has turf orientation. It was easy for us to cooperate in the issue of women's business start-up program because no one had done this before. Therefore in my opinion, it is very difficult to cooperate with other departments in our original responsibilities because everyone has turf orientation. But if it is a new area, it is easier for us to cooperate. This is my experience here” (A).*

## **(2) Many interactions**

Examples of this kind include J, L, and O.

*“We have a lot of interactions. For instance we cooperate with Ministry of Economic Affairs, Ministry of Education, and Government Information Office in our affairs of cultural industry. We do it together with Council of Agriculture, Department of Health, Ministry of Interior, and Council of Hakka Affairs in our Community Renaissance. The Premier chairs with cross-department group meeting every three months. I think we have good interactions with other departments in implementing these affairs” (J).*

*“I think we have many interactions and cooperation with Ministry of Interior, Department of Health, Council for Economic Planning and Development, and Ministry of Education. Because Executive Yuan deals with affairs together, we cooperate to accomplish many works of Executive Yuan. In the past, every department didn't have any relationship in cooperation with each other. At least among us, we built up the cooperation of cross departments. We even have cooperation with Council of Cultural Affairs. Concerning this past, we are very positive” (L).*

*“I think most of the time we get along with each other” (O).*

### **5.3.2 Second Kind of Interactions**

In terms of the role of the interactions with other ministries, we find two types: (1) Cooperation with one another, such as A, and L cooperated with other departments to achieve their affairs; (2) Coordinating with other ministries, such as O, and N.

#### **(1) Cooperation with one another**

Examples of this kind include A and L, which had shown in 5.3.1.

#### **(2) Coordinating with other ministries**

Examples of this kind include O, and N.



*“Sometimes my department is responsible for coordination. We also play the role of research, development and evaluation to represent Executive Yuan to inspect the progress of some works or to coordinate the tasks between some departments” (O).*

*“I am mainly responsible for the role of communication between Executive Yuan, political parties, and departments. Executive Yuan has various ministries and departments. Every department has frequent interaction with one another; however, the policies between departments might conflict with each other, such as Ministry of Labor Affairs and Ministry of Economic Affairs. At this time, I have to serve as a coordinator” (N).*

### **5.3.3 Third Kind of Interactions**

From our interviews, we categorize the interaction between the ministry of the central female appointee and the Legislative Yuan into three types: (1) sometimes having conflicts, such as O, M, and L; (2) having a smooth relationship, such as A and J; (3) having a smoother relationship gradually, such as P

#### **(1) Sometimes having conflicts**

Examples of this kind include O, M, and L.

*“I think basically it’s OK, except some special cases. Of course sometimes due to some individual interests, unusual cases happened. Of course we knew the reasons behind. That is it! Of course sometimes as an appointee, you have to face this situation. You want to have a easy life and to do some negotiation? Or you feel you should resist and resist your decision. This is a matter of principle. I don’t think I have to negotiate with you. Some things are negotiable while others are not” (O).*

*“I used to serve as a legislator thus I understand the role of legislators and the operation of Legislative Yuan very much. I respect legislators because they represent people. The suggestions of legislators, as long as it benefits our people, we would adopt them. However, if the suggestion of legislators did not represent all members of our country or if it harms other people’s benefit, no matter how much pressure I would have to face, I would not adopt this suggestion. My priorities is peoples’ interests first, then party’s interests, group’s interests and lastly individual interests.” (M).*

*“I am very familiar with affairs of my ministry. We will accept all the questions and interrogations by legislators as long as these questions and interrogations are based*

*on facts. If not, I will defend for my policies. Of course sometimes when the Legislative Yuan make laws and modify laws related with my Ministry, it might not always be that smooth. Just as I said I would defend for my policies bravely. This is what I have to shoulder and I am willing to do” (L).*

## **(2) Having a smooth relationship**

Examples of this kind include A and J.

*“The affairs of my council are not complicated. Legislators seldom asked me about the affairs of my council. They used the interrogation time to have their individual performance. For instance, if they concern the issue of “textbooks” right now, they will ask me something about it...Because we don’t have any law to be passed in Legislative Yuan, the thing I care is the atmosphere at that time. This is what distinguishes us and other ministries” (A).*

*“No matter which party, political parties have the same will to implement cultural development. Therefore I can say that I meet fewer obstacles in Legislative Yuan. The other reason that I have a smoother relationship in Legislative Yuan is my husband. He earned a lot of people’s respect. Many current legislators were his colleagues or friends. Therefore during my four-year term, I appreciate Legislative Yuan very much. No matter the ruling party or the opposite, they support our culture” (J).*

## **(3) Having a smoother relationship gradually**

Examples of this kind include P.

*“In the primitive stage, we indeed faced some difficulties. Because in the primitive stage everybody didn’t recognize mainland policies would have so obvious influences on our society and economy. Therefore, at the beginning, we all were not accustomed to the adjusting process. Hence at the beginning we met some difficulties in the coordination with Legislative Yuan and other departments” (P).*

### **5.3.4 Fourth Kind of Interactions**

We categorize the interaction between the bureau of the local female appointee and other bureaus into four types: (1) good interactions, such as C and D; (2) the supervisor agent of other bureaus, such as I and H; (3) competitor of other bureaus, such as B; (4) advisor of other bureaus, such as E and F.

#### **(1) Good interactions**

Examples of this kind include D.

*“Yeah it’s not bad! Maybe because I am a female, I feel quite smooth to interact*

*with others. For instance, we have good relationship with Bureau of Finance. As long as we need the support, they will provide it” (D).*

## **(2) The supervisor agent of other bureaus**

Examples of this kind include I and H.

*“The relationship between us is all right. Because we have to supervise others, sometimes we are in the opposite positions. Another aspect is that I had worked in city government before my appointment; therefore, everyone has acquaintance with me” (I).*

*“Because the decision made by my department is authorized by the mayor and the decision of my department is for other bureaus to follow...We are to supervise the affairs of other bureaus to help them administrate by laws. In the negative perspective, we correct the mistakes of other bureaus. While in the positive perspective, we help them to avoid administrative mistakes” (H).*

## **(3) Competitor of other bureaus**

Examples of this kind include B.

Interviewee B expressed that the two disadvantages of her bureaus: one is takeover of other bureaus’ old affairs; the other is the shortage of professionals.

*“In terms of the relationship with other bureaus, my bureau has its disadvantage because it is a new bureau. Many affairs in my bureau had administrated by other bureaus. Nowadays these affairs are integrated and assigned to my bureau. Hence my bureau has its disadvantage. Take public arts for instance. When every bureau has public construction, it likes to do public arts by itself. Hence this whole city will lack the development harmony of public arts. Therefore although the laws have passed that public arts belongs to the affairs of my bureau, the past habit causes the suppressing feeling that it is conducted by my bureau. Therefore we have to go through a lot of communications. Another part is our professional. As an agent our professional is not enough. For instance, like I just said we had to reorganize the cultural landscape. This takes architecture design and implement. However the human resource of my bureau is people of the Cultural center and the new added people are very young. Hence we don’t have a strong team in the perspective of human resource. We have to propose a huge amount of money to reconstruct old architecture; hence, the professional expertise is very important for us to propose a strong and persuasive argument and earn the budget. However for the time being, my bureau doesn’t have enough expertise; therefore, we are very weak in competition with other bureaus for resources” (B).*

#### **(4) Advisor of other bureaus**

Examples of this kind include E.

*“In the past there were few regulations and other bureaus didn’t have the documents of regulations. After the enactment of the Laws on Local Government Systems, we can create regulations. In the past every bureau was weak in regulation enactment, but as the times of governed by laws, regulation enactment becomes very important. Other bureaus reply on my bureau very much” (E).*

### **5.3.5 Fifth Kind of Interactions**

We categorize the interaction between the bureau of the local female appointee and the local council into three types:

#### **(1) Good Interactions**

Examples of this kind include C, D, E, G, H, and I.

*“We have a coordinator to communicate between our bureau and our council. He is good at analyzing affairs and he is also a very aggressive person. Therefore when I served at this post and communicated with our councilors, I felt he understood the temperament of our councils. I went to visit our councilors before I started to work here, our councilors encouraged me to work on this post. At the first three months on this post, I almost spent one hour to answer the councilors’ phone call after the official work time” (C)*

Interviewee C pointed out that taking care of the councilors’ needs was very important. She expressed,

*“Sometimes the councilor called to inquire something, if you understood this matter and called back to the councilor and let the councilor feel you valued his/her needs and helped him/her deal with that. Sometimes people went to the councilors and asked for help. If I couldn’t help the councilor, he/she would have difficulty to face his/her constituency. Then I would tell the councilor “Please give me the phone number of that person, I will talk to him/her directly.” Then I would tell that person, “That councilor inquired about your situation. However, there is some kind of difficulties that we can’t help. But the councilor called us and I explained to him/her. The councilor asked me to make a phone call and explain this to you” (C).*

Actually the councilors were very supportive to the affairs of interviewee C’s bureau. Interviewee D expressed that her experiences with the councilors were not bad. She thought as a female, she felt good at communicating with

councilors.

*“Only one member of the council has a lawyer background. In this professional area, serving at this post, I have earned the trust and respect from the council. Sometimes the director of law affairs of the council would asked me “Did you read that document?” If I said “yes”, the director would reply “then I don’t need to worry about it!” Every councilor, including the director of the council, rely and respect our expertise” (E).*

*“We have good relationship, because we respect our councilors and our councilors concern social affairs a lot and they hope to provide the constituency better services. Therefore we regard the councilors as our important resources. Because we have limited social workers of our bureau and we can’t take care everybody, but we have fifty-five councilors in every county and town. We added some changes to take advantage of the concern of social affairs from the councilors. For instance, some low-income families could go directly to the councilor’s office and we would handle this case reported by the councilors. We would investigate this case. If there was something that we overlooked, we would improve it. If not, we would explain the regulations and the laws to the councilor. After the councilor understood that, people went directly to the councilor’s office and the councilor would explain the difficulty to people. Therefore, I think we have good relationship with our council” (H).*

*“Because I have served on this post for only two months, the relationship with the council is all right. I am still in the honeymoon vacation with the council” (I).*

## **(2) Becoming Smoother Gradually**

Examples of this kind include B.

*“After conflicts in Department of Information, I felt the problem of council became smaller. The budge of my bureau was not cut by the council at all. Therefore I don’t have any difficulty in the council” (B).*

## **(3) Hardship**

Examples of this kind include F.

*“Because we have to do a lot of charity works and distribute money to low-income families and retarded people. People who receive the money will be very happy but those who do not will feel resentful. Therefore, he will ask the councilors to negotiate or lobby. This will cause our burden. My colleges often had to spend a lot of time in dealing with the interruptions of social welfare distribution by councilors” (F).*

## 5.4 Characteristics of Female Appointees

In our interviewees' opinion, women were more subtle, softer, preserved, professional, and serious. We summarize their opinions as follows:

### (1) More delicate, expressed by N, L,

*“But concerning female appointees, I think her determination and perseverance, maybe because of the factor of sex, through my observations of several female appointees, are very good. In addition to delicacy, perseverance, we are unlikely to retreat and compromise when facing pressure. I myself would be probably very durable and patient. In fact, I have a quick temper. But I will train myself that if I can't make it in one time, I will try it again” (L).*

*“I think I will not emphasize my sex on purpose when I serve as a female appointee. For instance, although Tsai Ying-wen, the Chairwoman of Mainland Affairs Council, is a female, when she faces the intimidation of China or deals with cross-strait affairs, she represents people in Taiwan, her identification is the chairwoman of Mainland Affairs Council; therefore, she won't response in submissive attitude” (N).*

### (2) More gentle, expressed by K, F, C, D

*“I said mentioned before that we hope to establish the model of female appointee. I always think most of the current appointees have to be devoted to this work. But maybe the way female appointees use is softer. We are softer. Actually, I value the development of my subordinates a lot. I hope to provide them a good working environment. In other parts, I don't think there is any difference between male and female appointees” (K).*

*“I don't think there is bid difference between sexes. But I think women can take a softer attitude” (F).*

*“I don't know if my personality is more neutral. I don't think there is big difference between sexes. But there is one point that male supervisor might think it is natural for you to work after your working schedule. But I think it is best for workers to complete their work in the working schedule and they can go home after work. Therefore I will think unless it is very urgent won't I call my subordinates. I think it's time for you to take a break, and then you should take a rest. Supervisors don't want to take a rest; it belongs to the business of the supervisor. But the subordinate should take a rest, thus we should let them take a rest” (C).*

*“I think women have one characteristic that is she is willing to listen and communicate. This characteristic is important for a director or a leader. Sometimes when your coworkers are very tired, if you are willing to listen to them and communicate with them. Let them know their pain is not that serious. And if there is something they are not satisfied, their director is willing to concern and to communicate. I think this would be a great encouragement to them. Many male appointees or male directors can't do this because they would feel shy” (D).*

### **(3) Professional, expressed by H, and E**

*“Women are more down to earth. They emphasize more on professional. Women who participate in politics stick more on their ideals and visions. Women don't have that strong ambition in politics; thus, it is harder to bribe them” (H).*

*“I think the current female appointees in Kaohsiung are more professional-oriented. There is no doubt about their appointment” (E).*

### **(4) Serious and careful, expressed by G, and A**

*“Women are more serious. If they serve as a committee member, they will do that job well” (A).*

## **5.5 Policy Suggestions from Our Interviewees**

The following summarizes the suggestions from our interviewees as ways to increase the gender equality in political participation both in numbers and in performance.

### **5.5.1 Gender Quotas to Protect Political Opportunity**

The modification and enactment of current laws are one of the ways to effectively raise the population of women that serve at high level positions. Asia Pacific Gender Equality Network (2004) found the enactment of laws is one of the most effective ways to increase the ratio and number of women in politics. Studies that carried out in Australia, Canada, Germany, New Zealand, Norway, the United Kingdom, and the United States showed a positive correlation between proportional representation systems and the number of women in the national legislature (UNDP, 2000). Taiwan doesn't have any enactment in laws about the ratio of the employment of female appointees. Since in 2000 President Chen Shui-bien promised to employ 1/4 female

political appointees in his cabinet. During his presidency, the ratio of female political appointees becomes one consideration in choosing cabinet candidates. Besides president's campaign promise, interviewee N pointed out the legislative election still adopts 1/10 women's quota, which is out dated; she suggested to modify and make laws to protect the equal rights in political participation. Interviewee records show as follows:

*"Just as I just mentioned to you that currently besides the legislator election does not change into 1/4, the election of county legislators has passed 1/4 women quota. Besides by the political competition to earn women's seats, through the Legislative Yuan to modify the Constitution is the fastest and the most direct way. The 1/10 quota has been out of date for a long time. Now even without gender quota, female legislators still could contain 1/4 seats" (N).*

*"First of course I will think my party is willing to; it has 1/4 quota in women's political participation. Moreover, President Chen Shui-bien carried out 1/4 to let all women have more spaces to participate in public affairs. I think in the past women probably didn't have any chance to decide important affairs or to have chance to explore her rights; so women probably were educated to be indifferent to public affairs. I think this is a new age; we of course expect more women to care about public affairs, not only to care about things near by, but to the big world, big affairs. I think if we cannot let 1/2 population to do many policies and to let 1/2 population without any participation, to let them stay in the kitchen and become naïve; this is not fair. We hope in the future all public affairs that both genders have chance to participate together" (L).*

Gender quotas have been initiated by political parties to significantly increase women's representation. Men in Taiwan hold most of political resources. Although DPP and KMT have regulated 1/4 gender quotas in their party rules, those rules have limited obligations. This research suggests putting gender quotas into our Constitution, i.e. 30% or 40%, for both sexes to ensure balanced representation in decision-making bodies. Nordic countries have the highest number of women in the lower or single house of national legislatures, all which have some type of quota in place: Sweden-40%, Finland and Denmark-34%, Norway-38%(APGEN, 2004). Under such gender quotas, female political elites have been budding in these countries. Hence, Taiwan should enact at least 30% gender quotas into our Constitution to protect equal political participation for both genders.



### 5.5.2 The Active Attitude

The positive and active attitude is important for women's participation in politics. For instance, interviewee B and M encouraged women to break the psychological bond and make the best of their lives:

*“Don't limit yourself. Break the stereotype of the role of genders. Because the devotion to public affairs gives people the stereotype-superwoman and tomboy. Those are artificial oppression. Because in the whole capitalism women assist to create that “man is superior and woman inferior”. Therefore women have to go on a diet, lose weight and have cosmetic surgery. Women have to be tender, beautiful to be the right model. Women who adopt strong attitude are tomboys. This is discrimination and besmirches and gives women a lot of limitation. Therefore whenever women have close access to power, women tend to retreat. Therefore I think we need to have an internal revolution. Therefore I think feminism is very important, just as I said the concept of androgyny. In fact, in terms of characteristics, women do not have big difference from man.” (B).*

*“You don't need to think “I am a woman. You have to think I am a person! I am not afraid to face any problems. I am a person! I am an independent person, a capable one! I have confidence in myself and I have countless potential. There is nothing too hard for me. The second premise is full of enthusiasm...keep a light mood and keep learning in sensibility to keep track with the society. You can not live outside this society.” (M).*

Besides an internal revolution and value herself, Interviewee A and Interviewee I pointed out women were too self-disciplined that they refused many political opportunities such as promotion and building important human resources of politics.

*“They are more serious, but men are usually more casual. Therefore I think men and women in terms of participation, sometimes women are too nervous, too serious and too honest. I think if we take other people's money, we should fulfill the task. But if it is a no-pay job with only traffic payment, I think you can participate these more to understand what Ministry of the Interior is doing, what Council for Cultural Affairs is doing and what Department of Health Executive Bureau is doing. I think this is not through political theory but through practical face to face interaction you will know who is the director of which section within Department of Health Executive Bureau , and who is the director of which section of Council for Cultural Affairs. I think men*

*are very good at this. Therefore when they want to formally enter into elections or political operations, their previous spawn and foundation are very solid, but if women want to be a candidate in an election, she would find she has expertise but she has insufficient human resources. Therefore, I suggest women not tot define political participation too serious and too great, such as you are doing this interviewee; in fact, you are also concerning public affairs” (A).*

*“We have found that if the superior wants to give a woman promotion, women will ask themselves first if they have enough ability. If she doesn’t think she has enough ability, she will refuse her superior first. But man is different. He will say “OK!” He will not think if he can do it or not. He will grasp the power first. If women want to participate in politics, there are two dimensions for women to adjust. First, you should develop your own expertise” (I).*

Interviewee I pointed out to pursue actively was a way to reduce the numerical inferior *“I think it’s faster that women help themselves, which means we develop our expertise... The second is to pursue actively. “OK! Oh! I have to think about it!” Then you miss the chance. But when you miss it, you will probably find the one that accept that position is inferior to you. Why could you take that opportunity actively?” Therefore if women have confidence in themselves, they have to take opportunity actively.”*

### **5.5.3 Professional Ability and Public Affairs Participation**

Besides an active attitude, female appointees N, B, and L agreed that women should develop their expertise, such as professional knowledge, management and leadership ability, communication and coordination ability. Interviewee record shows as follows:

*“Women have to possess the characteristics to participate in politics. She has to be able to deal with things by herself, to be interested in politics and public affairs and pay long-term attention on public affairs. I think this is the necessity to increase female political elite. Without interest, we can’t force women to participate in politics.” (N).*

*“Women need to learn expertise... Women need to participate in organizations and through organizations to participate in public affairs and through actions to train themselves.” (B).*

Interviewee L, who takes charge of a major government department, said

*“Chance only gives to those who are ready.”* Most interviewees thought the awareness of female’s self-consciousness and the development of expertise as the first step to increase the number of women to participate in politics and serve as political appointees.

Our research found many female political appointees have participated into public affairs for a long time. They not only enlarged their living areas but also accumulated experiences, knowledge and skills of politics. Thus, interviewee A recommended it is a good way to learn to participate through participating in community affairs. Taiwan government should nurture more women talents in politics through encouragement of public affairs participation and let women shoulder important decision-making for Taiwan.

#### **5.5.4 The Adjustment of Social Values and Family-Friendly Policies**

Our interviewees mentioned the necessity to adjust the external social values. Responsibilities of taking care of children, cooking, and doing the laundry, are the reason that women can’t make sufficient use of their talents. Our interviewee record shows:

*“I still think our society give women many responsibilities, such as caring. Those responsibilities, in fact, still need our society to change its social values and men to adjust their values. These adjustments in fact help women to have more space to explore themselves. You can also see nowadays, not only in political field, but in business world, many women elites are continuously budding. I think these are very good representatives; these representatives similarly will bring some changes on the social values. When others stop taking these as alien but to accept or to appreciate, I think this part means transformation; I also expect there will be more excellent women budding in every field of the society to explore their talent. I myself am quite positive” (O).*

Interviewee C pointed out the concept that house chores should not belong only to man or woman; husband and wife should share it with each other. She noted, *“Domestic chores are a matter of the family members. My husband said, “I help you doing the house chores.” I will say “why do all house chores belong to me? All house chores given to you, I help you do it.”*

According to “The investigation and report of marriage, child-caring, and employment on Women in Taiwan” by Bureau of Statistics (2003), the children before school cared by professional workers only contains 20%, in which

above 90% of children under age two were cared by women. In elder caring, 80% of disabled elders were cared by family, at which 80% were female. Lu (2002) stated that two million female with working ability didn't work because of taking care of their family. The balance between house work, caring, and work has been a major trouble for women. Two political appointees with children pointed out directly that the installment of parent-children space and baby sisters would help women work comfortably and have leisure to participate other activities.

*“In fact there are many women who are very ambitious and they are component. But maybe some values in our society tie them up. Like when I had worked at Department of Urban Development, I created a “parent-child space” in which children could stay. When their mothers worked here, they could felt more relaxed. I have been a career woman thus I can totally understand the feeling of being a career women. I used to think about quitting, but my mother stopped me because that process is of great hardship” (O).*

*“If we see foreign movies, they all have baby sisters. In fact our country at this part is not very mature...After parents work off, out of eighty or ninety percent is mothers to pick up their children. When men are in their thirties or forties, they devote all their efforts in work. He will say “he forgot to accompany children in their growth.” But mothers won't forget. Even I am very busy today, I will still leave some time to my children” (C).*

This research thinks the government has the responsibility to get involved into family caring tasks, to push for “community caring”, to encourage the establishment of nursing and child-caring institutes; at the same time, the government should enact laws to reduce the caring responsibility of women by child fund, parents leave and parents bonus.

Scandinavian countries are governing by both genders; its complete social welfare system, including public nursing home, child bonus, parents leave, and parent bonus make women to get rid of inferior status caused by birth and further to enlarge their living sphere, and redress gender inequality in politics. Though our government has implemented “Gender Equality in Employment Law” since 2001, 96% of women never take a maternal leave. This law only applied to companies more than 30 people. However, most companies in Taiwan are small and medium-size business units. Therefore, this law should be modified to take into account of women working for small companies.

### 5.5.5 Education

Interviewee D, G, F, and K pointed out education could effectively raise the population of women in politics. Gender equality education, the content of education, female scholarship in laws and politics, science camp, lectures, keynote speech and positive media image all would help woman recognize her ability of leadership, communication, and management. Interviewee records show as follows:

*“The first obstacle comes from women themselves. When I interacted with the community people, some husbands encouraged their wives to step out of their family to serve as volunteers, but some women were not willing to. Women themselves thought they had to put family into the first priority. Women have to take good care of husband, children and family. If there is anything left, only then could they have time to do these things (volunteers). Therefore this is the self-obstacle of women. How do we break this? Only by education could children break such perspective” (D).*

*“I think it’s by multiple methods! No matter in the regulation of laws, which has to give quota in political participation; in other words, it should include encouragement principles in it; besides, in the education process, we should let woman understand that actually she can influence others; moreover, in some camp and training, we have to train her to have organization ability and leadership ability. Therefore during those two or three years, we had held women’s groups camp; female friends are probably more used to deal with personal affairs, because in the past she didn’t receive education that has to participate in public affairs, or to participate in family discussion, and when she meet things, she has to communicate and negotiate; she has fewer training in this perspective...Of course in school education, it depends on if teachers and the environmental planning give these girls certain development spaces. It seems it has; therefore nowadays women are quite active and also have independence!” (G).*

*“Fundamentally speaking, I feel education and family are the most fundamental things...When I served at Civic Training Center, we held female leadership class; we developed women to serve as managers. This training in fact is quite important...I think we should give women more equal opportunities. In education content, our city holds science camp every year, to that her feel she also has the same ability...” (F).*

*“Of course it’s from education because our education fundamental law used to*

*mention that we are going to develop students with robust citizenship of democracy, and law. Therefore in the course teachers have to lead students to discuss the current issues to let her have independent ability to distinguish and to think. This is very important. Naturally in the participation of public affairs, she will have her own ability to distinguish and trust herself when all men doubt her. This also depends on courses, by the improvement of course content. Courses in the past didn't discuss this matter, but in modern society, we should discuss it. Taiwanese basically are not very sensitive to multiple cultures and genders; in foreign countries, this is very sensitive...The content of courses should move forward with times, and have continuous renovation; some permanent core values have to internalize into every citizen; that is the most difficult part" (K).*

Under the traditional gender stereotypes, such as “men the field, women the hearth”, “men the doctor, women the nurse”, “men the scientists, women the literature teacher”, “men the superior, women the subordinate”; both men and women could not development themselves. Family education, school education and public media should transmit gender equality consciousness. Such actions will help to break the oppression on both genders and facilitate men’s and women’s personal development and political participation. Interviewee D noted women limited themselves because of traditional concepts. Taiwan has implemented gender equality education laws to redress gender stereotypes in the contexts of textbooks and to eliminate gender discrimination of female students and teachers. However, the enactment of gender equality education doesn’t regulate specific amount of financial resources to implement such laws. This research suggests our government provide substantial amount of money to carry out the gender education.

### **5.5.6 Others**

Interviewee G mentions about the importance of women’s groups that concerns about public issues.

*“In fact, we see during those years, no matter in political field or people’s groups, women’s groups have got more attention. For instance, in the past, women’s groups only provided on cooking or mother’s classroom, but if like cooking or mother’s class could compose a strong group, and then transfer to concern public affairs; in fact, this power is quite strong. We can see from the component of women’s groups. In the past, it could be Women’s Association or Women’s Unions. Now it’s different; of course there are some women’s groups founded out of political parties, such as Beautiful Association”(G).*

Hsu (2002) provided the same suggestions that Taiwan needs women's groups to promote political participations. This is effective way to increase the population of women in politics in U.S. In Taiwan, such women's groups can nurture female talents in political arena but also advocate for gender equality in Taiwan society.

## **Chapter 6 Policy Suggestions and Conclusions**

This research explored the factors that influence the political participation of female appointees through in-depth interviews. This chapter summarizes our research findings and provides policy suggestions and research suggestions.

### **6.1 Research Findings**

#### **6.1.1 Political Participating Factors**

Female political appointees in this research are drawn from elites, such as legislators, professors, teachers, lawyers and journalists. Nine out of sixteen female political appointees showed profound political interests through active participation in political activities and social movements, which allows them from movement to government. Interviewees in this research also expressed that the president or their mayor invited them to serve as such posts because of appreciation of their past working experiences and administrative experiences.

Among twelve married interviewees, eight of them didn't marry into a political family, and most of their spouses were supportive in their political participation. In fact, the political lives of three married female appointees in Taiwan were triggered by their husbands' political activities and encouragement. They claimed that the influence from husband was enormous. Husbands of these three married appointees also shared in house chore and childrearing. In our research, we notice that two interviewees have adult children while seven interviewees have teenager kids to take care of. Two of them even once tried to quit their jobs to be a full-time housekeeper. In fact, all of those interviewees with children either have relatives to help them in child caring or hire a nanny to do the house chores. This frees them from house chores and helps them have the vital resource of political participation-time!

#### **6.1.2. The Deterrents of Women to Participate in Politics**

This research interviewed sixteen female political appointees. We find some mothers opposed their daughters to step into politics. Furthermore, the very division between public/private and man/woman composes the different expectations on male and female political appointees, such as house chores,



caring and even their abilities in dealing with politics.

### **6.1.3 Gender and Political Impact**

Gender makes a difference. Three interviewees tended to promote capable female in their divisions. Explicit examples include interviewee N asked her subordinates to invite at least one female commissioner of each commission and interviewee B noticed that past “gender-neutral” policy resulted in fewer female taking advantage of the government loan. Thus she started a female-friendly policy and helped a lot of women to start their own business. For other female political appointees, some of them expressed their unique sensitivity as women in decision-making process.

### **6.1.4. The Characteristics of Women in Politics**

The interview records of eight female political appointees in central government shows the variety of their responsibilities, which indicate women in Taiwan shoulder much more responsibilities than before and gain more space to apply their ability.

Interviewed female political appointees addressed several characteristics of female political appointees. The list of these characteristics includes hard working, delicacy, perseverance, inclined to communication, and dislike of the distance of bureaucracy.

### **6.1.5 Research Results Comparison**

Comparison with Hsu (2002), women ministers showed more activism, which allows them from movement to government. Hsu (2002) found that family support in house chores and childcare was essential for female legislators, which is consistent with our findings. In our investigation, we found that our interviewees with young children to take care of either have relatives to help them in child caring or hire a nanny to do the house chores, which implies it is hard for women themselves to strike a balance between motherhood and political participation without others’ help; meanwhile, this also reflects that the positions of appointment take much time and energy to devote to.

## **6.2 Policy Suggestions**

Most female appointees participated in public affairs actively. Most of the deterrents of female political appointees derived from the negative effects of stereotypes. They accepted such posts out of their expectations on their policy, out of the chance of government reform, and out of the desire to increase people's welfare. Support from family, encouragement from family and understanding from family compose important drive for them to serve as political appointee.

Female political appointees in Taiwan are a rarity. They are well-educated, independent and competent. Political leader's attitude and electoral system is of paramount importance to balance the disparity among gender. Evidences have shown that female political appointees progress gender equality in our society and in governmental organization. In order to increase women's political participation, strategies can be considered in the following areas:

### **a. Advocacy in gender awareness in politics**

Many policies seem "gender-neutral", but, in fact, they don't concern the differences between gender; hence, the actually effect on both gender is not equal. Public policy has great impact on the resources distribution between genders. In order to correct and avoid gender inequality, gender awareness in policy making should be emphasized.

### **b. Long-term strategies for engaging younger generations**

Younger generations are the future of the country. Gender education in school is of paramount important. Education should allow younger generation the ability to develop themselves and possess the ability to contribute to the society and further the confidence to participate in high-level politics.

### **c. Gender quota**

The application of gender quota effectively increases the number of female political appointees in Scandinavia countries. In order to increase women's opportunity to serve as political appointees, the application of gender quota in political appointment should be considered.

In conclusion, school education and public education is of paramount importance. The expertise through work experience and the continuous participation in public affairs will enlarge the pool of female political appointee candidates; therefore, giving women more opportunities in job promotion of private and public sectors is of equal importance. Further, gender quota will also increase women's opportunity to serve as political appointees.

### **6.3 Suggestions for Follow-up Study**

In order to explore the appointive factors, the appointive opportunity by appointers is very important. The researcher suggests follow-up study interview the president, the mayor, and the magistrate to have a better understanding of the factors of appointive opportunity by appointers.

To compare with gender difference in politics, the researcher suggests follow-up study interview male appointees to understand determinants of their political participation, their contribution in politics, and their political chances in politics. With these data, it would enable the follow-up researcher to compare determinants of political participation between female and male appointees.

The research has tried to explore the political participation factors of female political appointees in Taiwan. Although we interviewed sixteen female political appointees; however, as time passed by, there will be other new female political appointees. The reason that they participated in politics is also worth of investigation.

There is a dearth of the personal background data of female political appointees. Thus this research suggests setting up the data of female political appointees in Taiwan for further qualitative and quantitative research of female appointees.

## Appendix I ROC Government Directory of Political Appointees

### ROC Government Directory of Political Appointees

Institute	Position	Number
The National Assembly	Secretary- General	1
Office of the President	Secretary- General	1
	Vice Secretary-General	2
Academic Sinica	Dean	1
	Vice Dean	2 or 3
Academia Historica	Director	1
National Security Council	Secretary- General	1
	Vice Secretary-General	1 or 3
National Security Bureau	Director	1
	Vice Director	1
The Executive Yuan	Premier	1
	Vice Premier	1
	Minister without Portfolio	5 or 7
	Secretary- General	1
Ministry of Interior	Minister	1
	Deputy Minister	1
Ministry of Foreign Affairs	Minister	1
	Deputy Minister	1
	Delegate	8
	Representative	20
Subtotal	57	

  

Institute	Position	Number
Environmental Protection Administration	Minister	1
	Deputy Minister	1
Council for Economic Planning and Development	Chairperson	1

	Vice Chairperson	1 or 3
Veterans Affairs Commission	Chairperson	1
National Youth Commission	Chairperson	1
National Palace Museum	Director	1
	Vice Director	2
Atomic Energy Council	Chairperson	1
	Vice Chairperson	1
National Science Council	Chairperson	1
	Vice Chairperson	2 or 3
Science-Based Industrial Park Administration	Director	1
Research, Development and Evaluation Commission	Chairperson	1
	Vice Chairperson	2
Council of Agriculture	Chairperson	1
	Vice Chairperson	2
Council of Cultural Affairs	Chairperson	1
	Vice Chairperson	1
Council of Labor Affairs	Chairperson	1
	Vice Chairperson	1
Council of Mainland Affairs	Chairperson	1
	Vice Chairperson	2 or 3
Subtotal		32

Institute	Position	Number
Central Election Commission	Chairperson	1
Fair Trade Commission	Chairperson	9
	Vice Chairperson	1

Consumer Protection Commission	Chairperson	11 or 19
Public Construction Commission	Chairperson	1
	Vice Chairperson	2
Council of Indigenous Peoples	Chairperson	1
	Vice Chairperson	1
Council for Hakka Affairs	Chairperson	1
	Vice Chairperson	1
Coast Guard Administration	Minister	1
	Deputy Minister	1
Coordination Council for North American Affairs	Chairperson	3
National Council on Physical Fitness and Sports	Chairperson	1
	Vice Chairperson	1 or 2
Legislative Yuan	Secretary-General	1
Judicial Yuan	President	1
	Vice President	1
	Grant Justice	17
	Secretary-General	1
Supreme Administrative Court	President	1
Commission on the Disciplinary Sanctions of Functionaries	President	1
	Supreme Court	President
Examination Yuan	President	1
	Vice President	1
Subtotal		89
Institute	Position	Number
Examination Yuan	Member	19

	Secretary-General	1
Ministry of Examination	Minister	1
	Deputy Minister	1
Ministry of Civil Service	Minister	1
	Deputy Minister	1
Civil Service Protection and Training Commission	Chairperson	1
	Vice Chairperson	1
Control Yuan	Member	5 or 7
	President	29
	Vice President	
	Member	
National Audit Office	Secretary-General	1
	Auditor-General	1
Taiwan Provincial Government	President	9
	Member	
Fukien Provincial Government	Vice President	
	President	9
	Member	
Subtotal		82
Total		286

#### Taipei City Government Directory of Political Appointees

Institute	Position	Number
Taipei City Government	Deputy Mayor	2
Bureau of Civil Affairs	Director	1
Bureau of Finance	Director	1
Bureau of Education	Director	1
Bureau of Reconstruction	Director	1
Bureau of Public Works	Director	1
Bureau of Transportation	Director	1
Bureau of Social Affairs	Director	1

---

Bureau of Labor Affairs	Director	1
Bureau of Health	Director	1
Bureau of Environmental Protection	Director	1
Bureau of Urban Development	Director	1
Cultural Affairs Bureau	Director	1
Taipei Fire Department	Director	1
Department of Land Administration	Director	1
Department of Public Housing	Director	1
Department of Information	Director	1
Department of Military Service	Director	1
Research, Development and Evaluation Commission	Chairperson	1
Urban Planning Commission	Chairperson	1
Commission of Administrative Appeals	Chairperson	1
Rules and Regulations Commission	Chairperson	1
Council of Aboriginal Affairs	Chairperson	1
Department of Rapid Transit Systems	Director	1
Taipei Feitsui Reservoir Administration	Director	1
Taipei Water Department	Director	1
Civic Worker Training Center	Chairperson	1
Subtotal		27

---



## Kaohsiung City Government Directory of Political Appointees

Institute	Position	Number
Kaohsiung City Government	Deputy Mayor	2
Bureau of Civil Affairs	Director	1
Bureau of Finance	Director	1
Bureau of Education	Director	1
Bureau of Reconstruction	Director	1
Bureau of Public Works	Director	1
Bureau of Social Affairs	Director	1
Bureau of Labor Affairs	Director	1
Health Department	Director	1
Department of Environmental Protection	Director	1
Fire Department	Director	1
Department of Land Administration	Director	1
Department of Public Housing	Director	1
Department of Information	Director	1
Department of Conscription	Director	1
Research, Development and Evaluation Commission	Chairperson	1
Commission for Examining Petitions and Appeals	Chairperson	1
Rules and Regulations Commission	Chairperson	1
Commission of Indigenous Affairs	Chairperson	1
Department of Mass Rapid Transit	Director	1
Human Resource	Chairperson	1

---

Development Institute

Subtotal

22

---

Ciou, H.J. & Jhang, C.L. (2002). *Research on the installment of political positions*. *NPF Research Report*, 84. Retrieved October 12, 2004, from <http://www.npf.org.tw/PUBLICATION/IA/091/IA-R-091-084.htm>

## Appendix II Female Appointees' Profile of R.O.C.

	National District Number	Name	Position	The year of birth	Education	Experience	Political Party
Central Government	1	1 Tsai Ying-wen	chairwoman of Mainland Affairs Council	1956	Ph.D. of Laws, The London School of Economics & Political Science; Master of Laws, University of Cornell; Bachelor of National Taiwan University, Laws	Associate professor, Department of Laws, National Chengchi University; Professor, Institute of Laws, National Chengchi University; Professor, Institute of Laws, Soochow University; Advisor, Organization of International Economics, Ministry of Economics; Professor, Institute of International Trades, National Chengchi University; Member, International Trade Commission; Consultative Member, Mainland Affairs Council; Consultative Member, Fair Trade Commission; Consultative Member, National Safety Committee; Chairwoman, Mainland Affairs Committee; Member of the Sixth Legislative Yuan	NON
	2	2 Liou Shih Fang	Secretary-General of the Executive Yuan	1959	Master, Institute of Environmental Engineering, Oklahoma State University; Bachelor, Department of Chemical Engineering, Tamkang University;	1993-1995 Secretary General, Penghu County Government; 1997-1998 Director of Environmental Protection Bureau, Taipei City Government; 1999-2001 Vice Magistrate, Taichung County Government; 2002 Member of the Fifth Legislative Yuan; 2002 Secretary General, the Executive Yuan	DPP
	3	3 Chen Yu-chiou	Chairwoman of the Cultural Affairs Council	1949	Prix de piano & Prix de musique de chambre, Conservatoire National Supérieur de Musique de Paris, section musique	Professor, Department of Music, National Taiwan Normal University; Dean, College of Fine and Applied Arts, National Taiwan Normal University; President of Egret Foundation; Member of Art Education Committee, Ministry of Education; Member of Special Education Advisory Committee, Ministry of Education; Chairwoman, Advisory Committee, National Symphony Orchestra; Director, Institute of Music, National Taiwan Normal University; Director, Department of Music, National Taiwan Normal University; Director, Music Education Foundation, R.O.C.; Minister without Portfolio	DPP
	4	4 Chang Fu-meí	Chairwoman of the Overseas Chinese Affairs Commission	Non-interviewed appointee	Ph. D. of Philosophy, Harvard University; Master of Laws, Northwest University; Bachelor of Laws, National Taiwan University	1999-2000 Member of the Control Yuan; 1994-1998 Chairwoman of Administrative Appealing Commission, Taipei City Government; 1994-1985 Directors of National Assembly, DPP; 1992-1999 Member of the Second and Third National Assembly; 1988-1989 President of North American Taiwanese Women's Association; 1987-1991 Member of the Central Committee of Formosan Association for Public Affairs; 1984-1987 Lecturer of College of Laws, Stanford University; 1976/1978-1979/1981 Lecturer of College of Laws, University of California, Berkeley; 1970-1982 Associate Director of North America Taiwanese Professors' Association; 1978-1994 Researcher of Hoover Institute, Stanford University; 1967-1979 Researcher of College of Laws, Harvard University	DPP

National District Number	District Number	Name	Position	The year of birth	Education	Experience	Political Party
	5	5 Chen Chu	chairwoman of the Council of Labor Affairs	1950	1968 Bachelor, Dept. of Library and Information Studies, Shih Hsin College; 1998 Graduate School of Social Development, Shih Hsin University; 1998-1990 Master, Institute of Public Affair Management, National Sun Yat-sen University	1979 Board member of Directors, Eastern Asian Association for Human Rights; 1986-1995 Secretary-General, President, Taiwan Association for Human Right; 1991-1993 Member of the Second National Assembly; 1995-1998 Director, Bureau of Social Affairs, Taipei City Government; 1998-2000 Director, Bureau of Social Affairs, Kaohsiung City Government; 2000 Minister, Council of Labor Affairs, Executive Yuan; 1998-2000 Chairperson of Central Review Committee, Democratic Progressive Party; 2002-2004 Member of Central Standing	DPP
	6	6 Lin Fang-meí	Minister of National Youth Commission	1961	Ph.D in Sociology, University of Pennsylvania, USA, 1992; Bachelor, Department of Foreign Languages and Literature, National Taiwan University, 1984	Associate Professor, Department of Journalism, National Chengchi University; Professor, Department of Journalism, National Chengchi University, 1996-2000; 1993-1994 Associate Director of the Awakening Foundation, 1995-1996 President of Taiwanese Feminist Scholars Association; 1997-2001 Associate Director of the Peng Wan-Ru Foundation; 2000-2001 Associate Director of Taipei Association for the Promotion of Women's Rights; 1993-1994 Columnist of Independence Morning News; 1995-1996 Columnist of United Evening News; 1999-2000 Columnist of Liberal Times News; 2004 Coordination Council for North American Affairs	DPP
	7	7 Fan Sun-lu	Deputy Minister of Education	1951	Bachelor, Political Science, TungHai University; Master, American Studies, Tungkang University	Member of Central Review Committee, 3 terms, Democratic Progressive Party; 1993-1995 Director, Secretary Section, Democratic Progressive Party; 1996-1999 Member of the Third Legislative Yuan; Member of Education Committee; Chair of Education Committee, Session II & IV; 1999-2000 Member of the Fourth Legislative Yuan; President, Council for the Promotion of Sustainable Development, The Legislative Yuan; Member, Cultural Enactment Union, The Legislative Yuan	DPP
	8	8 Kuo Yao-chi	Minister of State & Chairperson of Public Construction Commission	1956	Bachelor, Department of Urban Planning, National Cheng Kung University, 1978; Master, Urban Development Planning, University of London, UK, 1986	Division Chief, Bureau of Public Works, Taipei City Government, Feb. 1990 - January 1994; Planning Officer, Urban Planning Commission, Taipei City Government, January 1994 - Feb. 1995; Secretary General, Bureau of Public Works, Taipei City Government, Feb. 1995 - Oct. 1995; Director-General, Department of Public Housing, Taipei City Government, Oct. 1995 - July 1999; Director-General, Department of Public Affairs, Office of the President, R.O.C., Oct. 2000 - January 2002; Executive Director, 921 Earthquake-Disaster Recovery Commission, Executive Yuan Aug. 2002 -- Present; Minister without Portfolio / Chairperson, Public Construction Commission, Executive Yuan, Feb. 2002 -- Present	DPP

National District Number	District Number	Name	Position	The year of birth	Education	Experience	Political Party
	9	Yeh Chulan	Minister of the Council for Hakka Affairs	1949	1970 Bachelor, Department of Laws, Fu Jen Catholic University	1979-1989 Business Director, Lian-Guang Advertisement Corp.; 1980-2000 Member of the First, Second, Third Legislative Yuan; 1992 Vice Director of Legislators, DPP; 1995 Director of Legislators, DPP; 1990-2000 Member of Interior, Foreign Affairs, and Judicial Committee, The Legislative Yuan; 1996 Director of DPP President Campaign; 2000 Director of Hakka Affairs of DPP President Campaign; 2000-2002 Minister of Transportation and Communications	DPP
Taipei City Government	10	Yan Shang-Luan	Director of Bureau of Labors	Non-interviewee and appointee	1973-1977 Bachelor, Department of Laws, Chinese Culture University; 1979-1981 Master of Sociology, North Carolina State University at Raleigh; 1984-1990 Ph. D. of Sociology, Arizona State University	Director of Department of Labor Relations and Institute of Labor Studies, National Chung Cheng University	
	11	Ku Yenlin	commissioner of the Department of Social Welfare, Taipei City Government	1948	Ph. D. of Education Technology, University of Indiana; Master of Linguistics, Claremont Graduate School; Bachelor, Department of Foreign Languages and Literature, National Taiwan University	Professor, University of National Chiao Tung University; Director of the NON Awakening Foundation; Associate Director of Taipei Association for the Promotion of Women's Rights; Researcher of Women's Study Center, National Taiwan University; Visiting Scholar of Women's Study Center, Stanford University; Visiting Scholar of Toronto University	
	12	Chang Ming-jue	chairperson of the Administrative Appeals Commission, Taipei City Government	1951	Bachelor, Department of Laws, National Chengchi University; Master of Comparative Law, University of Virginia	Specialist, Executive Officer, Senior Executive Officer of Ministry of Justice; Specialist, Senior Executive Officer, Counselor of Committee of Laws and Regulations, the Executive Yuan; Member of Accountant Discipline Committee of Ministry of Finance; Member of Committee of Laws and Regulation of Taiwan Province	NON
Kaohsiung City Government	13	Kuan Biling	Director of the Department of Cultural Affairs of Kaohsiung City Government	1956	Ph. D of Politics, National Taiwan University	Associate Professor, Department of Public Affairs and Administration, National Taipei University; Director of The Public Administration Association of R.O.C.; Secretary-General of Taiwan Professor Association; Director of Department of Information, Kaohsiung City Government	DPP
	14	Shie Yun-jiau	chairperson of the Research, Development and Evaluation Commission of Kaohsiung City Government	1969	Bachelor and Master of Institute of Politics, National University	Secretary of Kaohsiung City Bus Administrator; Senior Executive Officer of Bureau of Construction, Kaohsiung City Government; Chief Editor of Master South Magazine	DPP

National District Number	District Number	Name	Position	The year of birth	Education	Experience	Political Party
	15	3 Chen Jin Bao	Director of Legal Affairs Bureau of Kaohsiung City Government	1953	1975 Bachelor, Department of Laws, Fu Jen Catholic University	1981-1983 Public Prosecutor of Yunlin District Court; 1983-1989 Public Prosecutor of Hsin-chu District Court; Lawyer in Kaohsiung, Pingtung, and Tainan; 2002 Director of Committee of Laws and Regulations, Kaohsiung City Government; 2003 Director of Bureau of Laws and Regulations, Kaohsiung City Government; Adviosr of Laws of the Kaohsiung Awaking Association; Associate Director of the Kaohsiung Association for the Promotion of Women's Rights	NON
	16	1 Wu Li-hsueh	director of the Bureau of Social Affairs, Kaohsiung Country Government	1956	Master of Institute of Education, Kaohsiung Normal University; 1970 Bechelor of Social Work of Fu Jen Catholic University	Assistant of People's Service; Catholic Labor Center; Director of Women and Youth Center; Director of Social Welfare Center, Kaohsiung County Government; Senior Executive Officer of Social Affairs Bureau, Kaohsiung County Government; 1999, Director of Social Affairs Bureau	NON
	17	1 Yang Shiou-bi	director of the Bureau of Social Affairs, Tainan Country	1964	1988 Bachelor of Department of Earth Science, Taiwan Normal University	1996-1998 Teacher of Guei Ren Junior High School; President of the first and second Teacher Association of Guei Ren Junior High School; 2000-2001 President of Tainan Teachers' Association; 2000-2002 Special Secreatary of Tainan County Government; 2002 Director of Social Affairs Bureau of Tainan County	NON
	18	1 Tu Yi-chuan	director of the Bureau of Social Affairs, Bingtung Country Government	1959	1975 Department of Mass Communication, Fu Jen Catholic University	1981-1983 Teaching Assistant, Department of Mass Communication, Fu Jen Catholic University; 1987-1999 Journalist and Director of Taiwan Times; 1999 Director of Social Affairs Bureau of Bingtung County	NON

## References

Abbott, P. & Wallace, C. (1990). *An Introduction to Sociology: feminist perspectives*. London: Routledge

American Government Lecturer Notes. (2001). Retrieved May 25, 2005, from [http://www.thinkwell.com/marketing/sampleNotes/GOV\\_note.pdf](http://www.thinkwell.com/marketing/sampleNotes/GOV_note.pdf)

Arceneaux, K. (2001). The gender gap in state legislative representation: new data to tackle an old question. *Political Research Quarterly*, 54, 143-60.

Arora, S. C. & Prabhakar, R. K. (1997). A study of municipal council elections in India: socioeconomic background of women candidates in Rohtak, Haryana. *Asian Survey*, 37 (10), 918-926.

Asia Pacific Gender Equality Network. (2004). Retrieved August 15, 2004, from <http://www.capwip.org/readingroom/5050sourcekit.pdf>

Badren, M. (2002). Islamic feminism: what's in a name? *Al-Ahram Weekly Online*, 569. Retrieved April 15, 2004, from <http://66.102.7.104/search?q=cache:7fVKn42kyu8J:weekly.ahram.org.eg/2002/569/cu1.htm+the+term+of+feminism+&hl=zh-TW>

Bayes, J. (1991). Women in the California executive branch of government (103-42). *Gender, Bureaucracy, and Democracy: Careers and Equal Opportunity in the Public Sector*. New York: Greenwood Press.

Black, J.H. & Erickson, L. (2003). Women candidates and voter bias: do women politicians need to be better? *Electoral Studies*, 22, 81-100.

Booth and Seligson (1978). Political participation. Retrieved June 11, 2004, from [http://ceiba.ntu.edu.tw/course/17052d/database/Political\\_Participaion.html](http://ceiba.ntu.edu.tw/course/17052d/database/Political_Participaion.html)

Bureau of Statistics. (2002). Retrieved from February 20, 2003, from <http://www.dgbasey.gov.tw/dgbas03/bs3/nalyse/new91352.gif>

Bureau of Statistics. (2003). Retrieved November 28, 2003, from <http://www.dgbas.gov.tw/dgbas03/div2all.htm>

Burns, N., Schlozman, K. L., and Verba, S. (2001). *The private roots of public action, gender, equality, and political participation*. Cambridge: Harvard University Press.

Caul, M. (1999). Women's representation in parliament: the role of political parties. *Party Politics*, 5, 79-98.

Caul, M. (2001). Political parties and the adoption of candidate gender quotas: a cross-national analysis. *Journal of Politics*, 63, 1214-1229.

Central Election Commission. (2005). Retrieved June 15, 2005, from <http://210.69.23.140/cec/cechead.asp>

Chanda, A. (2001). Systems of political appointment. Retrieved December 10, 2004, from <http://www.civic-exchange.org/publications/Intern/Systems%20of%20Political%20Appointment.pdf>

Chiang, S.H. (1996). *A study on female political elite- a case study on democratic progressive party female government personnel*. Unpublished master thesis. Institute of Public, National Taiwan University.

Chou, B. E. & Cal Clark. (1986). *The socialization of female elites in Taiwan*. Paper presented at the ninth annual meeting of the international society of political psychology, Amsterdam, Holland.

Chou, B. E., Cal and Clark, J. (1990). *Women in Taiwan politics: overcoming barriers to women's participation in a modernizing society*. Boulder: Lynne Rienner Publishers.

Chou, B. & Clark C. J. (1992). The changing role of the family in the making of political women in Taiwan: Generational differences in women's political socialization. *Proceedings of the National Science Council*, 2(2), 165-178.

Ciou, H.J. & Jhang, C.L. (2002). *Research on the installment of political positions*. NPF Research Report, 84. Retrieved October 12, 2004, from <http://www.npf.org.tw/PUBLICATION/IA/091/IA-R-091-084.htm>



Clark, R., Ramsbey, T. W. & Adler, E. S. (1991). Culture, gender, and labor force participation: a cross national study. *Gender and Society*, 5:47-66

Corner, L. (1997). Women's participation in decision-making and leadership: a global perspective. Retrieved June 20, 2005, from <http://www.unifem-eseasia.org/resources/techpapers/wleaders.htm>

Darcy, R., Welch, S., and Clark, J. (1994). Women in political office. In , elections, and representation. *Women and Politics in the United States and Europe*. N.Y.: Harper Collins College Publishers.

Dolan, J. (2001). Political appointees in the United States: does gender make a difference? *Political Science & Politics*, 34(2), 213-216.

Erickson, L. (1993). Making her way in: women, parties and candidacies in Canada. *Gender and Party Politics*. London: SAGE Publications.

Escobar-Lemmon, M. & Taylor-Robinson (2004). *Women ministers in Latin American government: when, where, and why?* Paper presented at the conference on Pathways to power: political recruitment and democracy in Latin America, Graylyn International Conference Center, Wake Forest University

Evans, J. (1995) *Feminist theory today* (13-25). London: The Cromwell Press.

Fan, Y. F. (1981). *Women in politics-a case study on Taipei female parliament*. Unpublished master thesis. Institute of Three Principles of the People, National Taiwan University.

Fox-Genovese, E. & Horstmann, S. (1995) Feminism. *The Encyclopedia of Democracy* (485-486). London: Routledge.

Gender Statistics. (2002). Retrieved December 1, 2003, from <http://www.dgbas.gov.tw/public/Data/411711334571.pdf>

Giele, J. Z. & Smock, A. C. (1977). *Women, roles, and status in eight countries*. N. Y.: Wiley.

Hoile, E. (2001). Su Chen-chang guards the fort as the pro-Blue army collapses.

E-Taiwa News. Retrieved December 11, 2004, from  
<http://etaiwanews.com/Focus/2001/08/25/998713111.htm>

Hsu, T.K. (2002). *Critical influencing factors in women's political participation in Taiwan: a study on the 4<sup>th</sup> female legislators*. Unpublished master thesis, Institute of Public Affairs Management, National Sun Yat-sen University.

Huang, C. L. (2003). Women and political participation. Retrieved April 10, 2005, from  
[http://www.womenweb.org.tw/English/SubIssue\\_Show.asp?SubIssue\\_ID=39](http://www.womenweb.org.tw/English/SubIssue_Show.asp?SubIssue_ID=39)

Iwamoto, M. (2001). The Madonna boom: the progress of Japanese women into politics in the late 1980s. *Political Science & Politics*, 34 (2), 225-226.

Jacobs, J. A. (1996). Gender inequality in political representation: a worldwide comparative analysis. *Social Forces*, 78, 235-268.

Kenworthy, L. & Malami, M. (1999). Gender inequality in political representation: a worldwide comparative analysis. *Social Forces*, 78, 235-268.

Kirschten, D. (2001). Kicking glass. *Government Executive*, 32(2), 16-23.

Kohn, W. S. (1980). *Women in national legislatures: a comparative study of six countries*. Westport: Praeger.

Ku, Y. L. (2003). Feminist theory and schools. *Historical Monthly*, 165, 70-78

Lewis, G. B. & Nice, D. (1994) Race, sex, and occupational segregation in states and local governments. *American Review of Public Administration*, 24(4), 393-410.

Liang, S. L. (1993). Analysis of Taiwan provincial legislator's political participation factors. *Social Sciences*, 41, 1-30.

Liu, M. C. (2002). Community care and women's employment. Retrieved March 12, 2005, from <http://www.pwr.org.tw/public/book.asp?id=91>

Liu, Y.H. (1998). *White paper on women's status in Taiwan: 1995*. Taipei:

China Times Publication.

Lovenduski, J. & Hills, J. (1981). *The politics of the second electorate: women and public participation*. London: Routledge and Kegan Paul.

MaLaughlin, J. (2003). *Feminist social and political theory* (1-23). N.Y.: Palgrave Macmillan.

Matland, R. E. (1998). Enhancing women's political participation: legislative recruitment and electoral systems. *Women in parliament: beyond numbers* (65-88). Stockholm: International IDEA.

McCammon, H. J., Karen, E. C., Ellen M. Granberg, and Christine M. (2001). How movements win: gendered opportunity structures and U.S. women's suffrage movement, 1866 to 1919. *American Sociological Review*, 66, 49-70.

Medoff, M. H. (1986). Determinants of the political participation of women. *Public Choice*, 48:245-253.

Muñoz, B. V. (2002). Women's representation in decision-making positions in Europe: The Europeanization of national agendas or the nationalization of the European agenda? In the Proceeding of the International Studies Association Annual Conference, New Orleans, LA. Retrieved June 10, 2005, from <http://www.isanet.org/noarchive/munoz.html>

Norris, P. (1985). Women's legislative participation in western Europe. *West European Politics*, 8, 90-101.

Norris, P. (1997). *Passage to power: legislative recruitment in advanced democracies*. N. Y.: Cambridge University Press.

Norris, P, and Ronald, I. (2001). Cultural barriers to equal representation. *Journal of Democracy*, 126-40.

Norris, P (2002). *Democratic phoenix: reinventing political activism*. N.Y.: Cambridge University Press.

Norway Government (1996). *Women in politics: equality and empowerment*.

Retrieved December 16, 2003, from <http://odin.dep.no/bfd/engelsk/regelverk/rikspolitiske/004005-990219/index-dok000-b-f-a.html> (2003/12/16)

Oakes, A. & Almquist, E. (1993). Women in national legislatures: a cross-national test of macrostructural gender theories. *Population Research & Policy Review*, 12, 71-81

Park, K. A. (1999). Political representation and South Korean women. *The Journal of Asian Studies*, 58 (2), 432-448.

Paxton, P. (1997). Women in national legislatures: a cross-national analysis. *Social Science Research*, 26, 442-64.

Paxton, P., & Kunovich, S. (2003). Women's political representation: the importance of ideology. *Social Forces*, 82(1), 87-114.

Peng, Y. W. (1998). *Political participation and empowerment of community women: a study on Taipei female village directors*. Unpublished master thesis. Institute of Building and Planning, National Taiwan University.

Peng, Y. W. (2000). The Women's rights in Taiwan in 1999. Retrieved December 15, 2003, from [http://www.scu.edu.tw/hr/document\\_imgs/documents/d6\\_5.htm](http://www.scu.edu.tw/hr/document_imgs/documents/d6_5.htm)

Philips, A. (1995). Dealing with difference: a politics of ideas or a politics of presence? In Landes, J.B. ed. (1998), *Feminism, the public and the private*. Oxford University Press.

Political participation (2005). Retrieved February 23, 2005, from [http://www.statsvet.su.se/stv\\_hemsida/statsvetenskap\\_04/micheletti/participation\\_definition\\_right.htm](http://www.statsvet.su.se/stv_hemsida/statsvetenskap_04/micheletti/participation_definition_right.htm)

Randall, V. (1982). *How politics affects women. Women and politics* (157-206). London: Macmillan.

Randall, V. (1987). *Women and politics: an international perspective* (95-120). London: Macmillan.

Kerr, B., Miller, W., and Reid, M. (2000). Sex-based occupational segregation in U.S. state bureaucracies, 1987-97. *Public Administration Review*, 62 (4), 412-423.

Reinharz, S. (1992). *Feminist methods in social research*. New York : Oxford University Press.

Riccucci, N. R., & Saidel, J. R. (2001). The demographics of gubernatorial appointees: toward an explanation of variation. *Policy Studies Journal*, 29(1), 11-22.

Rule, W. (1987). Electoral system, contextual factors and women's opportunity for election to parliament in twenty-three democracies. *Western Political Quarterly*, 40(3), 477-498.

Rule, W. & Zimmerman, J. E. (1994). *Electoral systems in comparative perspective: their impact on women and minorities*. N. Y.: Greenwood Press.

Sapiro, V. (2003). Through a glass ceiling darkly: developments in the political psychology of gender stratification. In the Proceeding of the 2<sup>nd</sup> Annual Dilemmas of Democracy Conference: "Getting men to get it: what men really think about women in politics," Loyola Marymount University, Los Angeles.

Shi, T. (2002). *Political participation in Beijing*. Cambridge: Harvard University Press.

Shvedova, N. (1998). Obstacles to women's participation in parliament. *Women in parliament: beyond numbers*. Stockholm, International IDEA. Retrieved November 10, 2003, from <http://archive.idea.int/women/parl/ch2a.htm>

Squires, J. (1999). *Gender in Political Theory* (25). Oxford: Polity Press, 1999.

The China Post (1999). *The changing role of women over the last 100 years*. Retrieved April 22, 2005, from <http://www.taiwanheadlines.gov.tw/20000107/20000104f3.html>

The United National Fourth World Conference on Women (1995). Retrieved

October 6, 2003, from  
<http://www.un.org/womenwatch/daw/beijing/platform/decision.htm>

United Nation (1992). *Women in politics and decision-making in the late twentieth century: a United Nations study*. Netherlands: Martinus Nijhoff Publishers.

Travers, M. (2001). *Qualitative research through case studies*. California: SAGE Publications.

United Nations Development Programme (2000). *Women's political participation and governance 21<sup>st</sup> century challenges*. Retrieved November 6, 2003, from  
[http://magnet.undp.org/new/pdf/gender/wpp/women\\_book.pdf](http://magnet.undp.org/new/pdf/gender/wpp/women_book.pdf)

Women's Learning Partnership. (2004). Retrieved July 6, 2004, from  
<http://learningpartnership.org/facts/leadership.phtml>

World Guide to women in Leadership. (2004). Retrieved July 17, 2004, from  
<http://www.guide2womenleaders.com/Taiwan.htm>

Yung, W. Y. (2000). An analysis of electoral systems on women in politics. *Theory and Policy*, 14(4), 71-90.